

## **West Oakland Toxics Reduction Collaborative**

EJ Challenge: West Oakland is a community of 25,000 people located immediately adjacent to the Port of Oakland, through which the fourth highest volume in the U.S. of international container traffic flows. West Oakland has greater rates of premature birth, low weight birth, poverty, diabetes, and death due to heart disease, stroke, or cancer. This results in African Americans in West Oakland dying – on average – almost 15 years sooner than white residents in the Oakland Hills. Oakland is the 4th largest water port in the nation and container traffic is projected to double in the next 10 years. With Port expansion, diesel exhaust will rise as truck trips per day increases from 9,000 to over 22,000 by 2010.

Collaborative approach: As West Oakland faces escalating pressures from redevelopment - triggered in large part by the community's success in eliminating toxic sources, and from international goods movement - projected to triple by 2020, a broad multi-faceted multi-media approach has proven necessary and is well underway. The West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative (WOTRC) is co-chaired by West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project and USEPA Region 9, governed by a formal Partnering Agreement and supported by neutral facilitation. The approximately twenty partners include representatives from the City, County, State, Port, Bay Area Air Quality Management District, Pacific Gas and Electric, labor, truck drivers, academia, and elected officials. Co-chair and local resident Margaret Gordon recently joined the Port of Oakland Commission, where she has pledged to use her position to promote environmental and health protections at the port. The community's capacity and success in applying the collaborative model has resulted in the transformation of several other environmental forums in the Bay Area to a facilitated and community co-chaired format mirroring that of the WOTRC.

Action Plan: As a culmination of a long-term strategic planning process, representatives from approximately twenty partner organizations met in June, 2008, to create the attached logic model for moving forward in two focus areas:

- 1) Work to ensure there is a local air plan for West Oakland and goods movement related emissions reductions. The plan should be both feasible and equitable and therefore needs a commitment to quantifiable goals for reduction in community health risk through an 85% reduction attributable to Port-related diesel pollution recommended by the California Air Resources Board and Mayor Dellums' Port of Oakland Task Force and agreed to by the Port.
- 2) Use land use as a means to reduce air toxics in the West Oakland Neighborhood. The reuse of the Oakland Army Base to get trucks out of West Oakland is a unique and urgent opportunity.

Contacts: For more information, contact Richard Grow, 415-947-4104, or [grow.richard@epa.gov](mailto:grow.richard@epa.gov) or Karen Henry, 415-972-3844 or [henry.karen@epa.gov](mailto:henry.karen@epa.gov). More information is also available at this website:  
<http://www.epa.gov/care/community2006.htm#oakland>

## Navajo Uranium Contamination

EJ Challenge: From 1944 to 1986, nearly four million tons of uranium ore were extracted from Navajo lands. Today the mines are closed, but a legacy of uranium contamination from more than 500 abandoned uranium mines, homes built with contaminated mine waste rock, and contaminated water wells remains. Chronic exposure to these threats poses a risk of lung cancer, bone cancer, and impaired kidney function. While several federal agencies had addressed portions of the problem, urgent problems remained unaddressed, and the full scope of the problem was still unknown. Last October, Congressman Waxman called the legacy of uranium mining on the Navajo Nation “a 40-year bipartisan failure of government.”

Collaborative approach: In FY 2008, seven Region 9 divisions developed and successfully implement the first coordinated solution addressing uranium contamination on the Navajo Nation. The cross-divisional team built and led a coalition of federal, tribal, state, local, and non-governmental organizations to conduct the first coordinated response to a four-decade old problem affecting an area the size of West Virginia. The Team’s work has brought an unprecedented level of support and protection to people at risk from living in contaminated homes, drinking contaminated water, and living next to abandoned uranium mines.

Action Plan: In March, the Team produced an aggressive plan that achieves the environmental outcomes requested by both the Waxman Committee and the Navajo Tribe. The plan makes the most of existing appropriations and lays out a logical framework for addressing the highest risks while gaining a solid understanding of longer-term problems. The Team re-directed resources to obtain a fourfold increase in EPA funds and quickly mobilized to address the most urgent risks. In addition, the Team has leveraged other federal and non-federal resources, including over \$2M from Indian Health Service for safe water supplies and in-kind services from health professionals, universities, and non-profits.

Contacts: For more information, contact Clancy Tenley, 415-972-3785, [tenley.clancy@epa.gov](mailto:tenley.clancy@epa.gov), or Zoe Heller, 415-972-3074, [heller.zoe@epa.gov](mailto:heller.zoe@epa.gov). More information, including the full text of the five-year plan and the September 2008 Progress Report, is available at this website: <http://www.epa.gov/region09/waste/sfund/navajo-nation/index.html>

## **Air Toxics EJ Review**

EJ Challenge: EPA has identified “Reduce Exposure to Air Toxics” as one of the eight national EJ priorities. As described by the Integrated Urban Air Toxics Strategy (64 FR 38705, <http://www.epa.gov/ttn/atw/urban/fr19jy99.pdf>), EPA seeks to reduce air toxics impacts both nationally and locally through a series of programs focused on emissions from stationary, mobile, and indoor air sources. At the Regional level, efforts to reduce air toxics impacts include implementation of regulations – e.g. permitting, compliance assistance, and enforcement – and voluntary programs – e.g. grant programs for Tools for Schools, diesel retrofits, and community-based toxic reductions. While air toxics impacts can be widespread, the majority of air toxics impacts tend to be highly localized (a.k.a. “hotspot”). Thus, there is a significant potential for disproportionate impacts across geographic areas. Recognizing the potential for disproportionate impacts and specifically concerns about high cumulative risks in areas with vulnerable populations, it is important that efforts to reduce air toxics impacts be targeted in areas of greatest need.

Collaborative Approach: Region 9 has assembled a cross-division project team with expertise in air toxics, environmental justice (EJ), human health and risk, geographic information systems (GIS), environmental datasets, scientific peer review, and program evaluation. The program team includes representatives from the Region’s Air Toxics Risk Assessor, EJ Program, Geographic Information Systems (GIS) center, a RCRA inspector, a Scientist, and a program evaluation expert. The work is informed by consultation with external academic researchers.

Action Plan: In order to identify whether air toxics reduction efforts are occurring in the areas of greatest need, Region 9 proposes completion of a four step evaluation process. First, we will create a cumulative impacts index that identifies geographic areas with the highest multimedia environmental impacts and vulnerability factors that may exacerbate those impacts. Second, we will identify the locations of ongoing Regional toxic reduction efforts, focusing on voluntary toxic reduction activities initially. Third, we will quantitatively evaluate the locations of toxic reduction activities with respect to geographic areas with the highest cumulative impact scores. And fourth, we submit our methodology and results for both academic peer review and public scrutiny. By the end of FY09, the team will complete analysis of Region 9 voluntary programs using a version of the tool including at least social vulnerability variables.

Contacts: For more information, contact Zoe Heller, 415-972-3074, [heller.zoe@epa.gov](mailto:heller.zoe@epa.gov), or Matt Lakin, 415-972-3851, [lakin.matthew@epa.gov](mailto:lakin.matthew@epa.gov).

## Region 9 EJ Action Plan RROA - West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative (WOTRC)

Where WOTRC is now and what we see WOTRC's work being			SHORT TERM OUTCOME			INTERMEDIATE OUTCOMES	LONG TERM OUTCOMES
Resources/ Inputs	Activities (only things that WOTRC does, not that Port or targets do)	Outputs/ Products	2a) WHO has the power to bring about the outcome [that we need to influence]	2b) WHAT we want [them] to do	2c) HOW [we influence them]		
<p>WOTRC multiple stakeholder participants and what they bring to the table in expertise, experience, relationships and resources such as staff time and funding:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community based organizations</li> <li>• Elected officials</li> <li>• Government</li> <li>• Industry</li> <li>• Intermediaries /technical experts</li> <li>• Labor</li> </ul> <p>Funding</p> <p>In-kind contributions (e.g., staff time, meeting space)</p> <p>Non-WOTRC activities that can be leveraged</p>	<p>WOTRC capacity building to successfully implement Air Quality and Land Use focus area goals</p> <p>Convening forums for collaborative problem-solving</p> <p>Outreach to educate, engage, and maintain momentum</p> <p>Assessment, analysis and monitoring</p>	<p>Grants and funding, MOU's for joint work, in-kind member contributions of staff time and other resources</p> <p>Meeting proceedings, plans of action, learning</p> <p>Documentation</p>	<div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 10px; width: fit-content; margin: auto;">See the table below</div>			<p><b>A. AIR QUALITY</b></p> <p>Those responsible for air planning develop and implement local air plan(s) that reduce community health risk from (growing goods movement)</p> <p>Improved community and government/ agency collaboration</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Meaningful community engagement in the process</li> <li>• Transparent disclosure of government/ agency operations to impacted communities</li> </ul> <p><b>B. LAND USE</b></p> <p>Those responsible for land use planning develop and implement local land use plan(s) that move polluting trucks and truck serving businesses out of the West Oakland residential neighborhood and onto appropriate industrial lands (i.e., base reuse)</p> <p><b>C. CAPACITY BUILDING</b></p>	<p>Reduced toxic air emissions and diesel pollution from stationary and mobile sources</p> <p>Reduced incompatible land uses to promote safe, healthy, and sustainable community</p> <p>Reduced proximity and impact of diesel truck traffic to West Oakland residents</p> <p>Reduced public exposure to air toxics/improved public health</p>

Region 9 EJ Action Plan RROA - West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative (WOTRC)

<b>Short Term Outcomes*</b>		
<b>WHAT (2b)</b>	<b>WHO (2a)</b>	<b>HOW (2c)</b>
<b>A. AIR QUALITY</b>		
1	<b>TRUCK ROUTES.</b> Make sure that truck routes are implemented, monitored, enforced	The city (e.g., the planning department) The county (interstate)
2	<b>TRUCKER OUTREACH AND EDUCATION.</b>  Provide education and outreach to truckers. Pertains to truck routes and clean up plans.	The city/unions/other industry associations/ dispatchers
3	<b>ALTERNATIVE FUELS</b>  Use alternative fuels and alternative fuel vehicles	Progressive truckers Terminal operators Fuel suppliers Elected officials State/county
4	<b>BLUEPRINT</b> (Move it forward)	Joint Policy Committee of the Association of Bay Area Governments (JPC/ABAG)
		Public pressure Have them report to WOTRC Periodic reporting back from the city Create opportunities (e.g., green lanes) Apply pressure and generate will (e.g., better enforcement, political support, champions, grants and other funding, mayoral support) "70 block program" <i>WOTRC (Human Impact Partners - HIP, Breathe CA track air plan development and implementation against commitments and community goals (assess at the front end, track against established metrics during implementation)</i>

## Region 9 EJ Action Plan RROA - West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative (WOTRC)

<b>Short Term Outcomes*</b>			
<b>WHAT (2b)</b>		<b>WHO (2a)</b>	<b>HOW (2c)</b>
5 & 6b	<p><b>HEALTH STUDIES</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Help West Oakland obtain funding to do health studies</li> <li>- Really recognize disparate impacts</li> <li>- Collaborate with other officials</li> <li>- Bring site health data and other information into region/local health database/repository</li> </ul>	<p>Federal elected officials</p> <p>Alameda County Public Health Department</p>	<p>Briefings, testimony, reports (Identify specific existing reports), letters from agencies/academics around top priorities (research/action)</p> <p>Tell elected officials the top priorities of the community</p> <p>Through WOTRC</p>
6a	<p><b>AIR PLAN.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Create a local air quality plan focused on reducing all health risks</li> <li>- Create an enforcement “task force” (county, CARB, BAAQMD, city planning, EPA, city attorney department)</li> <li>- includes truck clean-up plan</li> </ul>	<p>Alameda County Public Health Department</p>	<p>Through WOTRC</p>
7	<p><b>EQUITABLE COST DISTRIBUTION.</b></p> <p>Get GM beneficiaries to pay the costs of polluting West Oakland (e.g., through container fees/leases)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Shippers</li> <li>- Cargo owners</li> <li>- Terminal operators (those profiting from moving goods)</li> <li>- Port</li> </ul>	<p>Comprehensive Truck Management Plan (CTMP)</p>
8	<p><b>PLANNING (general)</b></p>	<p>Local elected officials</p> <p>Industry operators</p>	<p>WOTRC offers elected officials a predesigned program (e.g., a “good neighbors program”)</p> <p>Get elected officials to champion these programs and get the target audience to develop the plans</p>
9	<p><b>POLITICAL ENGAGEMENT AND SUPPORT</b></p> <p>Encourage local politicals to make commitments</p>	<p>California Air Resources Board (ARB) and Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)</p>	<p>As a change in technique, make a clear ASK (by communities and others, e.g. “WOTRC asks Senator Boxer and others to ask ARB to ask . . . .” (The particular requests will be determined through the Collaborative process)</p>

Region 9 EJ Action Plan RROA - West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative (WOTRC)

<b>Short Term Outcomes*</b>		
<b>WHAT (2b)</b>	<b>WHO (2a)</b>	<b>HOW (2c)</b>
<b>B. LAND USE</b>		
10 thru 14	<b>LAND USE/TRUCK IMPACTS</b>	
	Enforce EJ policy when dealing with Port development projects for public health benefits	San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) City attorney
	Identify the legal requirements of the EIR	Port attorney City/zoning City planning
	Clarify who is responsible for what part of the shared responsibility for mitigating truck transport effects	Land owners
	Allocate/commit adequate land outside residential areas	City of Oakland Community Economic Development Agency (CEDA)
	Develop a master plan to achieve EIR goals	
	Assign zoning variances to businesses not land	Government agencies (city, port, Department of Transportation - DOT, BCDC)
	Implement community redevelopment plan	
	Get the industrial buffer	Community/WOTRC
	Help support land use concept/build resources for truck use at OAB	Oakland Maritime Support Services (OMSS)
		Who influences BCDC? By using legal assistance Convince landowners to redevelop site with clean uses Give guidance to landowners Work through redevelopment agencies and city officials (e.g., brownfields funding) Funding Proximity reports Address increased risks laid out in Health risk Assessment (HRA) Use other studies Report to city/port liaison com. And then their committees

## Region 9 EJ Action Plan RROA - West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative (WOTRC)

<b>Short Term Outcomes*</b>		
<b>WHAT (2b)</b>	<b>WHO (2a)</b>	<b>HOW (2c)</b>
<p>15 <b>LAND USE/OAB</b></p> <p>Create and implement a strong plan for Oakland Army Base redevelopment—one puts in place community-serving uses with businesses that will not bring daily truck traffic and without gentrification</p>	<p>City hall/decisionmakers/ Mayor</p>	<p>WOTRC vision for sensible land use</p> <p>WOTRC recommendations for the best mitigations</p> <p>Get traction with decision makers/get into the “main debate”/change the terms of the debate</p> <p>Show the financial gains of an alternative proposal (for the reuse of the land made vacant in West Oakland)—or approach the city help</p> <p>One day event</p>

\* NOTE: This chart is based on recommended areas of activity from discussions at a meeting of the full WOTRC on June 4, 2008, and as subsequently revised by the WOTRC Co-Chairs and Steering Committee in discussions with WOTRC participants

**R9 FY09 EJ Action Plan - Navajo RROA**

Resources/Inputs/ Partners	Activities	Outcomes		
		Short-term (awareness)	Intermediate (behavior)	Long-term (condition)
<p>\$6-7 million, EPA FTE, Navajo EPA</p> <p>EPA FTE, EPA grant/contract \$\$, Navajo Agencies, IHS, &amp; NGOs</p> <p>EPA SRF \$\$, EPA FTE, IHS</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 100 additional structures that may be contaminated with uranium will be screened.</li> <li>- Conduct outreach to impacted communities/residents.</li> <li>- Remediate 18 contaminated structures and 9 contaminated yards already assessed; 25 structures will then be replaced or rebuilt.</li> <li>- Issue health advisories, radio public service announcements, newspaper ads, and conduct outreach at community meetings about the 22 known contaminated water sources.</li> <li>- Complete construction of Black Falls water line extension.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Navajo residents increase awareness of dangers posed by mine waste used in structures.</li> <li>- Impacted residents gain knowledge of risks of drinking contaminated water.</li> <li>- Provide safe water directly and via a public watering point to about 40 homes that are impacted by four contaminated water sources.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Awareness and knowledge is used by EPA, Navajo EPA, and residents to identify additional contaminated structures.</li> <li>- Residents haul water from safe alternative sources.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Fewer Navajo residents live in contaminated homes and exposed to elevated levels of radiation/radon, improving human health.</li> <li>- Nobody drinks from known contaminated water sources, improving human health.</li> <li>- Reduce by about 100 the number of people drinking contaminated water in Black Falls, improving human health.</li> </ul>

Resources/Inputs/ Partners	Activities	Outcomes		
		Short-term (awareness)	Intermediate (behavior)	Long-term (condition)
EPA FTE, EPA Emergency Response \$\$	- Provide emergency bottled water to two particularly remote Black Falls area homes as a short-term action. (NOTE: Still working on this)	- Remote households gain access to safe water.	- Reduce the number of people drinking contaminated water in Black Falls area.	- Human health improved.
EPA Grant, \$20K	- Award EJ grant to a local Black Falls area non-profit	- Raise awareness of Black Falls residents of risks associated with drinking contaminated water.  - Develop long-term solution for Black Falls residents without nearby safe water sources.	- Black Falls residents haul water from only safe alternative sources.	- Human health improved.
EPA FTE, Navajo Superfund Program, EPA grant/contract \$\$, IPA	- Complete 520 on-site screens of abandoned uranium mines (AUMs).	- Using results of screens, conduct 5-7 more detailed assessments (PAs) each year to learn of any AUMs with exposure concerns.	- Increased knowledge of 520 mines is used by EPA and Navajo Superfund Program to remediate/reclaim those with highest risks.	- The risk of AUMs to residents and groundwater is reduced.