PAYT Best Practices and Success Stories

July 26, 2018
Welcome

- Introduction
- Webinar Format
  - Policy Tools/ PAYT Overview
  - Longmont, Colorado
  - Natick, Massachusetts
  - Q&A
Who is the Carton Council?

- Group of carton manufacturers formed in 2009 working to increase recycling of cartons
- Expanded access from 18% to >60% today
- Encourage implementation of proven policies/best practices
- Worked to develop a carton grade – PSI Grade #52
Why Encourage Certain Policies?

- Certain policies proven effective at “moving the needle”
- Relatively low cost
- Best practices key to success
- One size doesn’t fit all
POLICY IS AN IMPORTANT DRIVER TO MAXIMIZING RECYCLING

ATTRIBUTES OF HEALTHY RECYCLING PROGRAMS

- Efficient Collection and Processing Infrastructure
- Access to Convenient Recycling
- High Recycling Awareness and Participation
- Robust End Markets
- Goals, Plans, and Performance Tracking

POLICIES THAT CAN SUPPORT

- Policies that Create Funding Mechanisms
- Mandatory Service Provision
- Disposal Bans
- Best Practice Standards
- Best Practice Standards
- Mandatory Service Provision
- Building Code Provisions for Recycling
- Pay-As-You-Throw
- Source Separation Requirements
- Disposal Bans
- Mandatory Service Provision
- Policies that Create Funding Mechanisms
- Best Practice Standards
- Planning and Reporting Requirements
Effective Policies Include...

- Universal Recycling
  - Single-family, commercial, multi-family, public space/events
  - Best when pricing is “bundled” – no “opt in”
Effective Policies Include...

- Hauler Licensing
  - Works well when multiple haulers serve a community – can ensure same level of service
  - Single-family, commercial, multi-family, public space/events
  - Applicable to all community sizes
  - Can provide leverage to implement PAYT/universal recycling
Effective Policies Include...

• **Pay-As-You-Throw**
  
  • Base price generally includes recycling, may include yard trimmings and base level of trash service
  
  • Additional fee for additional disposal
  
  • Incremental costs MUST be adequate to encourage recycling
  
  • Flexible – many ways to implement
Implementation Options

- Different sized carts/bags for trash
- Different sized carts/free 2\textsuperscript{nd} cart for recycling
- Pay-per-bag without cart
- Pay-per-bag with cart
- Pay for out-of-cart setouts only
- Whether to allow out-of-cart setouts
- Funding structure – often part tax base, part bag fees

Some communities also....

- Reduce frequency of trash collection
- Add bulk collection program with bag/tag/sticker attached
- Add compost program to further enhance diversion
How Effective is PAYT?

- Nationally, communities see:
  - Recycling participation significantly
  - Tons recycled by 50% or more*
  - Tons disposed by 15 - 20% from residential sector

But many communities see a much more significant decrease in tons disposed

- In addition...
- In 2/3 of communities, no budget increase
- 90% of residents prefer, once implemented

## Specific Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Increase in Recycling Tons</th>
<th>Increase in Recycling Rate</th>
<th>Decrease in Waste Disposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ashland, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worcester, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malden, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandwich, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliot, ME</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanford, ME</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Source: Waste Zero
## Trash-Per Capita Disposed – Maine Communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>With PAYT</th>
<th>Without PAYT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lbs. Per Capital Trash Range (2017)</td>
<td>235 – 576</td>
<td>432 – 1,014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. Recycling Rate</td>
<td>33.1%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Closer to Zero Waste:
A Look at the Effectiveness of Residential Waste Strategies

Source: Institute for Local Self Reliance, *Closer to Zero Waste* to be released September 2018
Results in New England Communities

SMART – Decreases Overall Generation (waste + recycling) by 20+%  

SMART’s price signal produces **source reduction** and moves materials into all other programs, increases donations and home composting. Less generation lowers overall material handling costs.

- Duxbury MA before
- Duxbury MA after
- Marshfield MA before
- Marshfield MA after
- Malden MA before
- Malden MA after
- Natick MA before
- Natick MA after
- Raymond NH before
- Raymond NH after

[Bar chart showing waste and commodity recycling before and after implementation in various communities]
Citizen Satisfaction
Survey Results – 11 Municipalities

- 79% - Very or somewhat favorable
- 68% - Program is fair
- 74% - Participation is not difficult
- 89% - Program performing better than or as well as expected
- 77% - More likely to vote for someone supporting, or makes no difference

Participants in Pay-as-You-Throw Programs Have a Highly Favorable View of Them.

- Very Favorable 52%
- Somewhat Favorable 27%
- Somewhat Unfavorable 11%
- Very unfavorable 8%
- Not Sure 2%

Survey Conducted by Public Policy Polling for Waste Zero, 2014
## Benefits and Concerns with PAYT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Concerns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Financial incentive to divert/recycle</td>
<td>✓ Concerns about illegal dumping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Equitable – treats trash as a utility</td>
<td>✓ Rate structure may need adjusting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Flexible – many ways to implement</td>
<td>✓ Concerns of “regressive” pricing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Requires no additional funding</td>
<td>✓ Some perceive as “tax increase”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Can save in disposal costs</td>
<td>✓ Enhanced billing software, program management required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ GHG benefits</td>
<td>✓ Need to set up bag sale program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other Critical Elements...

- Best practices, including:
  - Enforcement
  - Communication/education/outreach
- Adequate funding
- Goals & performance tracking
- Robust end markets
PAYT Best Practices...

- Early, frequent, varied education & outreach – clear roles if shared responsibility
- For every 100% increase in volume, price should increase 50 – 80%* - Most effective closer to 80%
- Bundled services – automatic provision of recycling
- If cart system, recycling cart ≥ than trash cart
- Offer mini cart
- Work with haulers, public, local officials
- Anticipate concerns and address in advance
- Tout program successes!
- Simple rate structure with some flexibility

Policy Tools

• Keys to success
• Policies that support attributes of healthy programs
• PAYT fact sheet
• Universal recycling fact sheet
• Mandatory provision of service through hauler licensing
• How to implement a local ordinance
• Sample ordinances
• Benefits of a strong recycling program
• Funding mechanisms to support recycling
• Disposal surcharges as a funding mechanism
Examples of Tools

**HOW TO IMPLEMENT A LOCAL ORDINANCE TO INCREASE RECYCLING**

Many local governments want to increase recycling in their communities, and recognize the role that certain ordinances can play in achieving higher participation and materials recovery. The key to implementing successful and effective recycling programs is through education, outreach, and strong community involvement. Here are some tips on how to approach local policy development.

1. **Clearly Identify the Opportunity**: Understand what you want to achieve, and do research to ensure that the ordinance you are considering is an appropriate tool.

2. **Examine Existing Ordinances in the Jurisdiction**: Review existing ordinances to determine how they are implemented and what has worked well. This can be done by examining similar ordinances that have been implemented in other jurisdictions.

3. **Identify Key Stakes and Shepherd the Policy**: Identify key stakeholders and shepherd the policy through the approval process. The process may include meetings with city council members, staff, and other interested parties.

4. **Draft the Ordinance and Obtain Government Support**: Draft the ordinance and obtain government support. This may include holding public meetings or workshops where the ordinance is discussed and considered.

**THE BENEFITS OF RECYCLING**

- Reduces waste sent to landfills
- Saves energy and natural resources
- Reduces pollution

**SAMPLE ORDINANCES THAT BOOST RECYCLING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORDINANCE/BROAD POLICIES</th>
<th>ORDNANCE REQUIREMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boulder County, Colorado</td>
<td>- Ordinance No. 2013-01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|                          | - Commercial mix master
collection Ordinance |
|                          | - Mandatory bailing licensing |
|                          | - Universal recycling |
|                          | - Volume-based pricing |
|                          | - Mandatory recycling of specified materials |

- Ordinances that require or allow for the recycling of materials are also necessary. For example, Ordinance No. 2013-01 in Boulder County, Colorado, mandates that households operating in an unincorporated area of the county must be licensed.

**Recycling Creates Jobs and Other Economic Benefits**

- Recycling creates an estimated 554,500 jobs across the U.S., including 155,100 direct and indirect jobs.
- Recycling also generates $33.5 billion in economic output.

**What are the Economic Benefits of Recycling in Your State?**

To see the economic benefits of recycling in your state, visit [Recycle.org](www.recycle.org), which provides an interactive map of the U.S. showing economic impact by state.
Ways to Use Tools

• Learn various ways policies can be implemented in a variety of communities
• Use to spread awareness among local decision makers and elected officials
• Share with your SWAC

“Pay-As-You-Throw”
A Proven Way to Reduce Waste, Increase Recycling and Cut Disposal Costs

Pay-As-You-Throw (PAYT) is a unit-based waste collection fee system that, when implemented using a best practices approach, is the most effective way to give households an opportunity to save money by disposing of less waste and recycling more. Similar to other utilities like electricity and water, households are charged based on the quantity of waste they produce. The more they dispose; the more they pay; and the more they recycle, the less they dispose and the more they save.

More than 7,000 communities across the U.S. now have PAYT programs and boast impressive results. Research has found that adopting a PAYT program is the single most effective change a community can make to reduce the amount of waste disposed and increase recycling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PER-CAPITA WASTE DISPOSAL PAYT VS. NON-PAYT CURBSIDE</th>
<th>WHY PAYT?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cuts waste in half. PAYT communities, on average, dispose of 49% less waste than communities that include the cost of waste collection in property taxes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Where to Find Tools

www.cartonopportunities.org

Click on “Supporting Policy Tools”
Additional Information

• [www.payasyouthrow.org](http://www.payasyouthrow.org)

• [www.paytnow.org](http://www.paytnow.org)

• Institute for Local Self Reliance
  • PAYT + Real Source Separation = Zero Waste
  • Closer to Zero Waste: A Look at the Effectiveness of Residential Waste Strategies

• MA DEP – Implementation Guide
Thank you!