

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105

> Certified Mail No. 7015 3010 0000 3883 7325 Return Receipt Requested

Sean Haghi, President Create RE, Inc. 909 N Pacific Coast Highway Suite #385 El Segundo, CA 90245

# JUL 1 0 2019

Re: Consent Agreement and Final Order In the Matter of: Create RE, Inc.

Dear Mr. Haghi:

Enclosed please find the final executed Consent Agreement and Final Order (CA/FO) between the United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9, and Create RE, Inc.

Full compliance by Create RE, Inc. with the payment terms and completion of all actions enumerated in this CA/FO will close this case.

If you have any questions, please contact Edgar Coral, in the Office of Regional Counsel, at (415) 972-3898.

Sincerely, Nousballen

Douglas K. McDaniel Chief Toxics Section Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division

Enclosures

|          |   |  | (1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,1,  |  |  |
|----------|---|--|--|--|--|
| 1        | SYLVIA A. QUAST<br>Regional Counsel   |  | n de la seconda de<br>La seconda de la seconda de<br>La seconda de la seconda de |  |  |
| 2        | EDGAR P. CORAL<br>Assistant Regional Counsel  |  | ** FILED **  |  |  |
| 4        | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency<br>Region IX   |  | 10JUL2019 - 04:00PM  |  |  |
| 5        | 75 Hawthorne Street<br>San Francisco, CA 94105<br>(415) 972-3898                          |  | U.S.EPA - Region Og  |  |  |
| 6        | coral.edgar@epa.gov   |  |  |  |  |
| 7        |   | TED STATES   |  |  |  |
| 8        | ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY<br>REGION IX  |  |  |  |  |
| 9        |   |  |  |  |  |
| 10       | In the matter of:   | ) Doolest No. TSC  | A-09-2019-0050   |  |  |
| 11       | m the matter of.  |  | 4-09-2019- <u>000</u> 0  |  |  |
| 12       | Create RE, Inc.,  |  | NT AGREEMENT<br>FINAL ORDER  |  |  |
| 13<br>14 | Respondent.   | ) pursuant to 40 C.F.R. $\S$ 22.13(b),<br>22.18(b)(2), and 22.18(b)(3) |  |  |  |
| 15       |   |  |  |  |  |
| 16       |   |  | ·  |  |  |
| 17       | I. CONSENT AGREEMENT  |  |  |  |  |
| 18       | The United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX ("EPA"), and Create RE,      |  |  |  |  |
| 19       |   |  |  |  |  |
| 20       | Agreement and Final Order ("CAFO"). This CAFO simultaneously initiates and concludes this |  |  |  |  |
| 21       | proceeding in accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b) and 22.18(b).                         |  |  |  |  |
| 22       | A. AUTHORITY AND PARTIES  |  |  |  |  |

## A. AUTHORITY AND PARTIES

1. This is a civil administrative penalty action brought against Respondent pursuant to Section 16(a) of the Toxic Substances Control Act ("TSCA"), 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), for violation of Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), by failing to comply with Sections 402 and 406 TSCA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2682 and 2686, and their implementing federal regulations promulgated at 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E.

2. Complainant is the Chief of the Toxics Section in the Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division, EPA Region IX, who has been duly delegated the authority to bring this action and to sign a consent agreement settling this action.

3. Respondent, a California corporation located in El Segundo, California, is a residential property renovator.

#### B. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS

4. Pursuant to Sections 402(a) and (c) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2682(a) and (c), 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E provides requirements for certification of individuals and firms engaged in lead-based paint activities and work practice standards for renovation, repair, and painting activities in target housing and child-occupied facilities.

5. "Target housing" means any housing constructed prior to 1978, except housing for the elderly or persons with disabilities (unless any child who is less than six years of age resides or is expected to reside in such housing) or any 0-bedroom dwelling. Section 401 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2681.

6. "Person" means any natural or judicial person including any individual, corporation, partnership, or association; any Indian Tribe, State, or political subdivision thereof; any interstate body; and any department, agency, or instrumentality of the Federal Government. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

7. "Firm" means a company, partnership, corporation, sole proprietorship or individual doing business, association, or other business entity; a Federal, State, Tribal, or local government agency; or a nonprofit organization. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

8. "Renovation" means the modification of any existing structure, or portion thereof, that results in the disturbance of painted surfaces, unless that activity is part of an abatement as defined by 40 C.F.R. § 745.223. The term "renovation" includes (but is not limited to): the removal, modification or repair of painted surfaces or painted components (*e.g.*, modification of painted doors, surface restoration, window repair, surface preparation activity (such as sanding, scraping, or other such activities that may generate paint dust); the removal of building components (*e.g.*, walls, ceilings, plumbing windows); weatherization projects (*e.g.*, cutting

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

holes in painted surfaces to install blown-in insulation or to gain access to attics planning thresholds to install weatherstripping), and interim controls that disturb painted surfaces . . . . The term "renovation" does not include minor repair and maintenance activities. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

9. "Painted surface" means a component surface covered in whole or in part with paint or other surface coatings. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

10. "Component or building component" means specific design or structural elements or fixtures of a building or residential dwelling that are distinguished from each other by form, function, and location. These include, but are not limited to interior components such as . . . windows and trim (including sashes, window heads, jambs, sills or stools and troughs) . . . and exterior components such as . . . windowsills or stools and troughs, casings, sashes and wells. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

11. "Renovator" means any individual who either performs or directs workers who perform renovations. A certified renovator is a renovator who has successfully completed a renovator course accredited by EPA or an EPA-authorized State or Tribal program. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

12. Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and the Civil Monetary Penalty Inflation Adjustment Rule at 40 C.F.R. Part 19, which implements the Federal Civil Penalties Inflation Adjustment Act of 1990, 28 U.S.C. § 2461, as amended, authorize civil penalties not to exceed \$38,892 per day for each violation of Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689, that occurred on or after November 2, 2015 where penalties were assessed on or after January 15, 2018 but before January 15, 2019.

#### C. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

13. Respondent is a "person," as that term is defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

14. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent was a "firm," as that term is defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

15. In or around the Summer and Autumn of 2016, Respondent performed "renovations," as that term is defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.83, for compensation at the residential properties

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

located at: 6030 Jaymills Avenue in Long Beach, California; 215 East 85<sup>th</sup> Street in Los Angeles, California; 450 East Platt Street in Long Beach, California; and 1449 West 88<sup>th</sup> Place in Los Angeles, California (collectively, the "Properties").

16. At all times relevant to this CAFO, the Properties were "target housing," as that term is defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

17. Firms that perform renovations for compensation must apply to EPA for certification to perform renovations. 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(a).

18. On or after April 22, 2010, no firm may perform a renovation without certification from EPA under 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(a) in target housing unless the renovation is performed in target housing that has been determined to be lead-free pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 745.82(a). 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii).

12 19. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent did not have a certification from
13 EPA to perform renovations for compensation at the Properties.

20. At all times relevant to this CAFO, the Properties had not been determined to be lead-free pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 745.82(a) before the renovations for compensation occurred.

16 21. Respondent's performance of renovations for compensation at the Properties without
17 certification from EPA under 40 C.F.R. § 745.89(a) constitutes one violation of 40 C.F.R. §
18 745.81(a)(2)(ii) and Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

22. Firms performing renovations must comply with the work practice standards of § 745.85, including the cleaning of the work area until no dust, debris, or residue remains after the renovation has been completed. 40 C.F.R. § 745.85(a)(5)(ii).

23. Respondent did not clean the work area until no dust, debris, or residue remained after the renovations had been completed at the Properties.

24. Respondent's failures to clean the work area until no dust, debris, or residue remained after the renovations had been completed at the Properties constitute four violations of 40 C.F.R. § 745.85(a)(5)(ii) and Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

27 25. Firms performing renovations must retain documentation of compliance with the
28 requirements of § 745.85, including documentation that: a certified renovator was assigned to

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

1

2

ż

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

the project; a certified renovator provided on-the-job training for workers used on the project; a
 certified renovator performed or directed workers who performed all of the work practice tasks
 described in § 745.85(a); a certified renovator performed the post-renovation cleaning
 verification described in § 745.85(b); includes a copy of the certified renovator's training
 certificate; and includes a detailed certification by the certified renovator. 40 C.F.R. §
 745.86(b)(6).

26. Respondent did not retain documentation for the renovations performed at the Properties that: a certified renovator was assigned to the project; a certified renovator provided on-the-job training for workers used on the project; a certified renovator performed or directed workers who performed all of the work practice tasks described in § 745.85(a); a certified renovator performed the post-renovation cleaning verification described in § 745.85(b); includes a copy of the certified renovator's training certificate; and includes a detailed certification by the certified renovator.

14 27. Respondent's failures to retain documentation for the renovations performed at the 15 Properties that: a certified renovator was assigned to the project; a certified renovator provided on-the-job training for workers used on the project; a certified renovator performed or directed 16 17 workers who performed all of the work practice tasks described in § 745.85(a); a certified renovator performed the post-renovation cleaning verification described in § 745.85(b); includes 18 a copy of the certified renovator's training certificate; and includes a detailed certification by the 19 certified renovator constitute 24 violations of 40 C.F.R. § 745.86(b)(6) and Section 409 of 20 TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689. 21

#### D. <u>RESPONDENT'S ADMISSIONS</u>

23 28. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(b)(2) and for the purpose of this proceeding,
24 Respondent: (i) admits that EPA has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this CAFO and over
25 Respondent; (ii) neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations contained in Section
26 I.C of this CAFO; (iii) consents to any and all conditions specified in this CAFO and to the
assessment of the civil administrative penalty under Section I.E of this CAFO; (iv) waives any
right to contest the allegations contained in this CAFO; and (v) waives the right to appeal the

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

22

| 1  | proposed Final Order contained in this CAFO.   |  |  |  |
|----|--|--|--|--|
|    |  |  |  |  |
| 2  | E. <u>CIVIL ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY</u>   |  |  |  |
| 3  | 29. In settlement of the violations specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO,            |  |  |  |
| 4  | Respondent shall pay a civil administrative penalty of FIVE THOUSAND, ONE HUNDRED,               |  |  |  |
| 5  | AND THIRTY-FIVE DOLLARS (\$5,135). Respondent shall pay this civil penalty within thirty         |  |  |  |
| 6  | (30) days of the effective date of this CAFO. The civil penalty shall be paid by remitting a     |  |  |  |
| 7  | certified or cashier's check, including the name and docket number of this case, for the amount, |  |  |  |
| 8  | payable to "Treasurer, United States of America," (or be paid by one of the other methods listed |  |  |  |
| 9  | below) and sent as follows:  |  |  |  |
| 10 | Domlar Mail:   |  |  |  |
| 11 | Regular Mail:<br>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  |  |  |  |
| 12 | Fines and Penalties<br>Cincinnati Finance Center   |  |  |  |
| 13 | PO Box 979077<br>St. Louis, MO 63197-9000  |  |  |  |
| 14 | Wire Transfers:  |  |  |  |
| 15 | Wire transfers must be sent directly to the Federal Reserve Bank in New                          |  |  |  |
| 16 | York City with the following information:<br>Federal Reserve Bank of New York                    |  |  |  |
| 17 | ABA = 021030004<br>Account = 68010727  |  |  |  |
| 18 | SWIFT address = FRNYUS33<br>33 Liberty Street  |  |  |  |
| 19 | New York, NY 10045<br>Beneficiary = U.S. Environmental Protection Agency                         |  |  |  |
| 20 | Certified or Overnight Mail:   |  |  |  |
| 21 | U.S. Bank  |  |  |  |
| 22 | 1005 Convention Plaza<br>Mail Station SL-MO-C2GL   |  |  |  |
| 23 | ATTN Box 979077<br>St. Louis, MO 63101   |  |  |  |
| 24 | ACH (also known as Remittance Express or REX):   |  |  |  |
| 25 | Automated Clearinghouse (ACH) payments to EPA can be made through                                |  |  |  |
| 26 | the U.S. Treasury using the following information:   |  |  |  |
| 27 | U.S. Treasury REX/Cashlink ACH Receiver<br>ABA = 051036706                                       |  |  |  |
| 28 | Account = 31006, Environmental Protection Agency<br>CTX Format Transaction Code 22 – checking    |  |  |  |
|    | Consent Agreement and Final OrderPage 6Create RE, Inc.   |  |  |  |

|     | 1,       | Physical location of U.S. Treasury facility:  |
|-----|----------|---|
|     | 2<br>3   | 5700 Rivertech Court<br>Riverdale, MD 20737   |
|     | 4        | Remittance Express (REX) = (866) 234-5681   |
| 1 e | 5        | On Line Payment:  |
|     | 6        | This payment option can be accessed from the information below:   |
|     | 7<br>8   | www.pay.gov<br>Enter "SFO 1.1" in the search field<br>Open form and complete required fields  |
|     | 9        | If clarification regarding a particular method of payment remittance is   |
|     | 10       | needed, contact the EPA's Cincinnati Finance Center at (513) 487-2091.  |
| ł.  | 11       | A copy of each check, or notification that the payment has been made by one of the other  |
|     | 12       | methods listed above, including proof of the date payment was made, shall be sent with a  |
|     | 13       | transmittal letter, indicating Respondent's name, the case title, and docket number, to the   |
|     | 14       | following addresses:  |
| •   | 15       | Regional Hearing Clerk  |
|     | 16       | Office of Regional Counsel (ORC-1)<br>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX   |
|     | 17       | 75 Hawthorne Street<br>San Francisco, CA 94105  |
|     | 18<br>19 | Max Weintraub<br>Toxics Section   |
|     | 20       | Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division (ENF-4-1)<br>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX  |
|     | 21       | 75 Hawthorne Street<br>San Francisco, CA 94105  |
| •   | 22       | 20. Descendent chall not use normant of environment has this CAEO or a tory deduction   |
|     | 23       | 30. Respondent shall not use payment of any penalty under this CAFO as a tax deduction from Respondent's federal, state, or local taxes, nor shall Respondent allow any other person to |
|     | 24       | use such payment as a tax deduction.  |
|     | 25       | 31. If Respondent fails to pay the assessed civil administrative penalty of FIVE  |
|     | 26       | THOUSAND, ONE HUNDRED, AND THIRTY-FIVE DOLLARS (\$5,135), as identified in  |
|     | 27       | Paragraph 29, by the deadline specified in that Paragraph, then Respondent shall pay a stipulated   |
| 5   | 28       | penalty to EPA of \$500 per day in addition to the assessed penalty. Stipulated penalties shall   |
|     |          | Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 7<br>Create RE, Inc.   |
|     |          |   |

accrue until such time as the assessed penalty and all accrued stipulated penalties are paid and shall become due and payable upon EPA's written request. Failure to pay the civil administrative penalty specified in Paragraph 29 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph may also lead to any or all of the following actions:

(1) EPA may refer the debt to a credit reporting agency, a collection agency, or to the Department of Justice for filing of a collection action in the appropriate United States District Court. 40 C.F.R. §§ 13.13, 13.14 and 13.33. The validity, amount, and appropriateness of the assessed penalty or of this CAFO is not subject to review in any such collection proceeding.

(2) The U.S. Government may collect the debt by administrative offset
(*i.e.*, the withholding of money payable by the United States to, or held by the United States for, a
person to satisfy the debt the person owes the U.S. Government), which includes, but is not
limited to, referral to the Internal Revenue Service for offset against income tax refunds. 40
C.F.R. §§ 13(C) and 13(H).

(3) Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 13.17, EPA may either: (i) suspend or revoke
Respondent's licenses or other privileges, or (ii) suspend or disqualify Respondent from doing
business with EPA or engaging in programs EPA sponsors or funds.

(4) Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3701 *et seq.* and 40 C.F.R. Part 13, the U.S.
Government may assess interest, administrative handling charges, and nonpayment penalties
against the outstanding amount that Respondent owes to EPA for Respondent's failure to pay the
civil administrative penalty specified in Paragraph 29 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph.

Interest. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717 and 40 C.F.R.

\$13.11(a)(1), any unpaid portion of the assessed penalty shall bear interest at the rate established
according to 26 U.S.C. § 6621(a)(2) from the effective date of this CAFO, provided, however,
that no interest shall be payable on any portion of the assessed penalty that is paid within thirty
(30) days of the effective date of this CAFO.

(a)

27 (b) Administrative Handling Charges. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C.
28 Section 3717(e)(1) and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(b), Respondent shall pay a monthly handling charge,

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

22

based on either actual or average cost incurred (including both direct and indirect costs), for every month in which any portion of the assessed penalty is more than thirty (30) days past due.

(c) Nonpayment Penalties. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(2)
 and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(c), a monthly penalty charge, not to exceed six percent (6%) annually,
 may be assessed on all debts more than ninety (90) days delinquent.

#### F. CERTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE

32. In executing this CAFO, Respondent certifies that it is now fully in compliance with the federal regulations promulgated at 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E.

#### G. <u>RETENTION OF RIGHTS</u>

33. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(c), this CAFO only resolves Respondent's liabilities for federal civil penalties for the violation and facts specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO. Nothing in this CAFO is intended to or shall be construed to resolve: (i) any civil liability for violations of any provision of any federal, state, or local law, statute, regulation, rule, ordinance, or permit not specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO; or (ii) any criminal liability. EPA specifically reserves any and all authorities, rights, and remedies available to it (including, but not limited to, injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions) to address any violation of this CAFO or any violation not specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO.

34. This CAFO does not exempt, relieve, modify, or affect in any way Respondent's duties to comply with all applicable federal, state, and local laws, regulations, rules, ordinances, and permits.

## H. ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS

35. Each party shall bear its own attorneys' fees, costs, and disbursements incurred in this proceeding.

#### I. EFFECTIVE DATE

36. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18(b)(3) and 22.31(b), this CAFO shall be effective on the date that the Final Order contained in this CAFO, having been approved and issued by either the Regional Judicial Officer or Regional Administrator, is filed.

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

| 4  | 1   | J. BINDING EFFECT   |
|----|-----|---|
|    | 2   | 37. The undersigned representative of Complainant and the undersigned representative of             |
|    | 3   | Respondent each certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions |
|    | 4   | of this CAFO and to bind the party he or she represents to this CAFO.                               |
|    | 5   | 38. The provisions of this CAFO shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent and its               |
|    | . 6 | officers, directors, employees, agents, trustees, servants, authorized representatives, successors, |
| κ. | 7   | and assigns.  |
|    | 8   |   |
|    | 9   | FOR RESPONDENT CREATE RE, INC.:   |
|    | 10  |   |
|    | 11  | 6/4/2019  |
|    | 12  | DATE SEAN A. HAGHI<br>President   |
|    | 13  | Create RE, Inc.   |
|    | 14  |   |
|    | 15  |   |
|    | 16  |   |
|    | 17  |   |
|    | 18  |   |
|    | 19  |   |
|    | 20  |   |
|    | 21  |   |
|    | 22  |   |
|    | 23  |   |
| r  | 24  |   |
|    | 25  |   |
|    | 26  |   |
|    | 27  |   |
|    | 28  |   |
|    |     | Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 10<br>Create RE, Inc.  |

•

FOR COMPLAINANT EPA: romballer DOUGLAS K. MCDANIEL Chief, Toxics Section Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX

Consent Agreement and Final Order *Create RE, Inc.* 

II. FINAL ORDER EPA and Create RE, Inc. having entered into the foregoing Consent Agreement, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that this CAFO (Docket No. TSCA-09-2019-0050) be entered, and Respondent shall pay a civil administrative penalty in the amount of FIVE THOUSAND, ONE HUNDRED, AND THIRTY-FIVE DOLLARS (\$5,135), and comply with the terms and conditions set forth in the Consent Agreement. STEVEN JAWGIEL Regional Judicial Officer U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 12 Create RE, Inc.

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that the original of the Consent Agreement and Final Order in the matter of Create RE Inc. (TSCA-09-2019-0050), has been filed by the Regional Hearing Clerk, and a true and correct copy was served as indicated below:

# **Certified Mail**

Respondent:

Sean Haghi Create RE Inc. 909 N. Pacific Coast Highway (Suite #385) El Segundo, CA 90245

Complainant:

# Hand Delivery

Edgar Coral U.S. EPA, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105

Dated: July 10, 2019

Steven Armsey

Steven Armsey Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA, Region IX