

### Environmental Benefits Mapping and Analysis Program

Neal Fann U.S. EPA, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards Air Benefits and Cost Group

# Overview

- What is a human health benefits analysis and what purpose does it serve?
- How can BenMAP help perform a benefits analysis?
- Data inputs to BenMAP
- Demonstration of model interface and outputs
- Analytical transparency in BenMAP
- Use of BenMAP in non-US projects

# What is a Human Health Benefits Analysis?

- The process of:
  - estimating of improvements in health outcomes that result from improvements in air quality
  - applying a monetary value to those improvements in health outcomes
- Benefits information can help inform the selection of optimal air regulations

## **Benefits Analysis**



# What Health Effects Does EPA Quantify?

	Particulate Matter	Ozone
Current		
Mortality	$\checkmark$	(✓)
Chronic bronchitis	$\checkmark$	
Nonfatal heart attacks	$\checkmark$	
Hospital admissions	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
Asthma ER visits	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
Acute respiratory symptoms	✓	$\checkmark$
Asthma attacks	✓	$\checkmark$
Work loss days	✓	
Worker productivity		✓
School absence rates		$\checkmark$

## **Benefits Analysis**



# How Do You "Value" Changes in Health Outcomes?

- Cost of Illness (COI)
  - Medical expenses for treatment of illness
  - Captures the money savings to society of reducing a health effect
  - Ignores the value of reduced pain and suffering
- Willingness To Pay (WTP)
  - Lost wages, avoided pain and suffering, loss of satisfaction, loss of leisure time, etc.
  - Measures the complete value of avoiding a health outcome

# The BenMAP Model

A geographic information system-based program that:

- creates population level exposure surfaces
- estimates changes in incidence of a variety of health outcomes associated with changes in certain ambient air pollutants
- places a dollar value on changes in incidence of health outcomes

## The Data BenMAP Uses to Perform a Benefits Analysis



# Key Features of BenMAP

- User-friendly experience
  - Driven by windows-based graphical user interface
  - Results (exposure, incidence, and valuation) available in a variety of formats including ASCII, .dbf, and shape files
- Comprehensiveness
  - Model includes a substantial population, health and air quality databases
  - Model incorporates an integrated GIS mapping, query, and statistics tool
- Flexibility
  - Enables users to perform a standardized or highly customized analysis
  - Users can add their own population, air quality, and health databases

## Options for Providing BenMAP with Air Quality Data

- Model accepts user-provided air quality data, both monitored and modeled
- Provides several options for creating population exposure maps:
  - direct use of monitor or model data
  - use of model data with monitor data in a relative sense

## Options for Specifying Benefits Analysis

- Preloaded with hundreds of PM and Ozone concentration-response functions from US and Canadian studies
  - Users can easily add more C-R functions with the equation editor
  - Users can add region-specific baseline incidence rates
- Model enables users to pool and aggregate incidence and valuation results
- Model estimates distributions of incidence and valuation results using Monte Carlo methods

### The BenMAP Interface



# Alternative Ways to Analyze Air Quality Data

- Monitor Rollbacks
  - Useful for answering hypothetical questions like: "What if PM2.5 levels were reduced by 20 percent in Mexico City?"
  - Available options include percentage reduction, absolute reduction, and rollback to standard
- Spatial and Temporal Scaling
  - Use a combination of modeling and monitoring data to project future air quality
- Monitor Direct
  - Import monitoring data jnto BenMAP

### Step Two: Estimating Health Impacts

#### 🗟 🗳 Configuration Settings

ee			Data										
ataSet	Endpoint Group		Metric	Seasonal Metric	Metric Statistic	Author	Year	Location	Other Pollutants	Qualifier	Reference	Race	Gender
EPA PM2.5 C-R		Enapoint	Metho	Seasonal Metric	Metric Statistic	Autrior	Tear	Lucation	Other Polititarits	Qualmer	nelelence	nace	Gender
EPA FM2.3 C-n													
EFA Stanualu u	Mortality			_		-	-						_
÷.		Mortality, All Cause				-	-			-			
	Acute Myocardial In				-	-							
T el		Acute Myocardial Inf			-				-				
	1		D24HourMean		None	Peters et al.	2001	Boston, MA	-	-	Peters, A., D.W. Do	-	
<u>-</u>	Hospital Admissions,		D24Houmean		None	i eters et al.	2001	Doston, MA			1 6(618, A., D.W. DO		
1		HA, Chronic Lung Di											
È.		HA, Chronic Lung Di			1	-				-			
			D24HourMean		None	Moolgavkar	2003	Los Angeles, CA		Los Angeles County	Moolgavkar, S.H. Ai		
	-		D24HourMean		None	Ito	2003	Detroit, MI		Detroit, MI	Ito, K. Associations (		
(F)		HA, Pneumonia											_
(+) (+)		HA, Asthma											
( <b>+</b> )-	Chronic Bronchitis												_
(±)	Acute Bronchitis												
+	Hospital Admissions,												
÷.	Emergency Room V												
(±)	Acute Respiratory S												
÷.	Lower Respiratory S												
÷.	Asthma Exacerbatio												
÷.	Work Loss Days												
÷.	Upper Respiratory S												

#### <

Selected CR Functions: Function Identification Function Parameters DataSet Endpoint Group Endpoint Metric Seasonal Metric Metric Statistic Author Year Other Pollutants Qualifier Reference Gender Start Age End Age Incidence DataSet Prevalence Data... Variable DataSet Location Race Pope et al. 2002 EPA Standa Mortality Mortality, All I D24Hourk QuarterlyMean Mean 51 cities Pollution dal Pope, C.A., 3 30 99 2010 Mortality Incide EPA Standa Acute Myocardial Ir Acute Myoca D24Hourk Peters et a 2001 Peters, A., D. 18 2000 Incidence and None Boston, MA 24 EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 25 44 2000 Incidence and EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 45 54 2000 Incidence and EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 55 64 2000 Incidence and EPA Standa Acute Myocardial In Acute Myoca D24Hourk None Peters et a 2001 Boston, MA Peters, A., D. 65 99 2000 Incidence and 1 >

Run

Cancel

Previous

>

### Step Three: Pooling, Aggregating, and Valuing Health Impacts

Valuation Methods	Variable DataSet:									
EPA Standard Valuation Functions	EPA Standard Va	EPA Standard Variables 💽								
🛓 Acute Myocardial Infarction	Pooling Window	Pooling Window Name: Basic Functions			Basic Fu	inctions				
Acute Respiratory Symptoms Asthma Exacerbation	Endpoint Group	Endpoint	Author	Qualifier	Location	Start Age	Valuation Method	Pooling Method	~	
🛓 Chronic Bronchitis	Mortality	Mortality, All Cause						None		
<ul> <li>Work Loss Days</li> <li></li></ul>			Laden et al.			0				
							VSL, based on rang	-	-	
Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory			Pope et al.	0		0				
<ul> <li>Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular</li> <li>Lower Respiratory Symptoms</li> </ul>							VSL, based on rang			
Cower Respiratory Symptoms     Mortality			Woodruff et al			0	VSL based on rang		~	
<ul> <li>Upper Respiratory Symptoms</li> </ul>	-			-			LVSL based on rand			
	Pooling Window	Name: Cardio HA ov	er 65		Cardio HA	over 65				
	Endpoint Group			Valua	tion Method Poo	ling Method				
	Hospital Admission	15,				-				
				COI: I	ned costs + wa					
	Pooling Window	Name: Resp HA ove	: 65		Resp HA	over 65				
	28	Name: Resp HA ove	65							
	Endpoint Group		65	Valua		over 65 ling Method				
	28		65		tion Method Poo					
	Endpoint Group		65							
	Endpoint Group		65		tion Method Poo					
	Endpoint Group		65		tion Method Poo					
	Endpoint Group		65		tion Method Poo					
	Endpoint Group		65		tion Method Poo					
	Endpoint Group		65		tion Method Poo					

### Step Four: Reporting Results

comparatio	nResultsGridRep	ortForm						
Column Selection								
Grid Fields:	C-R Function Fie		Result Fie					
I Column I Row	Endpoint Gro     Endpoint     Pollutant     Author     Year     Qualifier     Location     LowAge     HighAge     Race     Gender     Other Polluta	Beta DistBeta P1Beta P2Beta A NameA B NameB C C NameC	Database CompiledFunction Incidence Incidence2 Prevalence Variar	<ul> <li>✓ Point Estimate</li> <li>✓ Population</li> <li>✓ Delta</li> <li>✓ Mean</li> <li>✓ Standard Deviation</li> <li>✓ Variance</li> <li>✓ Latin Hypercube Points</li> </ul>				
	ions Gridcell, then by C-R f C-R function, then by		Display Options Digits After Decimal Poi Elements in Previe					
Preview								
Column	Row	Endpoint Group Qualifier		Point Estimate	Population	Delta	Mean	Stanc 🔺
1	1	Acute Bronchitis	8-12	50	3690	15	47	27
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	18-24	0	3649	15	0	0
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	25-34	0	5740	15	0	0
			35-44	2	7669	15	2	1
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	30-44	2	7003	10	-	
1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54	5	5635	15	5	2
1 1 1		-						2
1 1 1 1	1	Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54	5	5635	15	5	
1 1 1 1 1	1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54 55-64	5	5635 4191	15	5 6	2
1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54 55-64 65-74	5 6 6	5635 4191 2681	15 15 15	5 6 6	2
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84	5 6 6 6	5635 4191 2681 1342	15 15 15 15 15	5 6 6 6	2 2 2
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84 85+	5 6 6 6 2	5635 4191 2681 1342 428	15 15 15 15 15 15	5 6 6 6 2	2 2 2 1
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84 85+ 27-44	5 6 6 2 8	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324	15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15	5 6 6 2 8	2 2 2 1 4
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84 85+ 27-44 45-64	5 6 6 2 8 6	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324 9826	15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15	5 6 6 2 8 6	2 2 2 1 4 3
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84 85+ 27-44 45-64	5 6 6 2 8 6 3	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324 9826 4451	15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15	5 6 6 2 8 6 3	2 2 1 4 3 1
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis Energency Room Visits, Respiratory	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84 85+ 27-44 45-64 65+	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 38	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324 9826 4451 12336	15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 3 38	2 2 2 1 4 3 1 10
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular	45-54 55-64 65-74 75-84 85+ 27-44 45-64 65+ 25-34; CO; no ICD410	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 38 0	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324 9826 4451 12336 5740	15       15	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 3 38 0	2 2 2 1 4 3 1 10 0
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular	45:54 55:64 65:74 75:84 85:+ 27:44 45:64 65:+ 25:34; C0; no ICD410 35:44; C0; no ICD410	5 6 2 8 6 3 38 0 1	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324 9826 4451 12336 5740 7669	15       15	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 3 38 0 1	2 2 2 1 4 3 1 10 0 0
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1           1	Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Acute Myocardial Infarction Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis Chronic Bronchitis Emergency Room Visits, Respiratory Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular	45:54 55:64 65:74 75:84 85:+ 27:44 45:64 65:+ 25:34; C0; no ICD410 35:44; C0; no ICD410 45:54; C0; no ICD410	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 38 0 1 2	5635 4191 2681 1342 428 12324 9826 4451 12336 5740 7669 5635	15         15	5 6 6 2 8 6 3 3 38 0 1 2	2 2 2 1 4 3 10 0 0 1

Cancel

ΟK

### Examples of Graphs Produced Using BenMAP Outputs (1) Age Group Impacts

### Mortality Impacts by Age Group



### Examples of Graphs Produced Using BenMAP Outputs (2) Distributions of Incidence

Cumulative Distribution of Total Change in Mortality from a 30% Reduction in PM<sub>2.5</sub> Levels



### Examples of Graphs Produced Using BenMAP Outputs (3) Distributions of Monetized Benefits

Cumulative Distribution of Value of Reductions in Premature Mortality from a 30% Reduction in PM2.5 Levels



## Map underlying population, air quality, and incidence

rates



# Analytical Transparency and Reproducibility

- BenMAP designed for public use and public scrutiny
- Published a detailed User's Guide with extensive appendices documenting model algorithms and data sources
- With each run, the user can generate an "audit trail" listing details of the run for QA and comparison with other analyses
- Consistent with Data Quality Guidelines, this "audit trail" can and should be shared with reviewers

gregation, Pooling, and Valuation Configuration Result: CVProgram Files/Abl Associates Inc/Configuration Results/presentation pooling example.apvr Configuration Results: CVProgram Files/Abl Associates Inc/Air Quality Grids/Presentation rollback base.agg © Control Air Quality Grid: CVProgram Files/Abl Associates Inc/Air Quality Grids/Presentation rollback control.agg Latin Hypercube Points: 10 Pollutant: PM2.5 Yea: 2000 Threshold: 0.000000 © Selected Studies ● Moolgavkar, 2000   55-74; C0; no ICD410 ● Moolgavkar, 2000   55-74; C0; no ICD410 ● Moolgavkar, 2000   55-74; C0; no ICD410 ● Lippmann et al, 2000   75-74; C3 ● Lippmann et al, 2000   75-74; C3; no ICD410 ● Lippmann et al, 2000   75-94; C3; no ICD4	×
<ul> <li>Baseline Air Quality Grid: C:\Program Files\Abt Associates Inc\Air Quality Grids\Presenation rollback base.aqg</li> <li>Control Air Quality Grid: C:\Program Files\Abt Associates Inc\Air Quality Grids\Presenation rollback control.aqg</li> <li>Latin Hypercube Points: 10</li> <li>Pollutari: PM2.5</li> <li>Year: 2000</li> <li>Threshold: 0.000000</li> <li>Selected Studies</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85-74; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85-74; C3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85-74; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85-74; 03, no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-74; 03, no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-74; 03, no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 200</li></ul>	
<ul> <li>Control Air Quality Grid: C: VProgram Files VAbt Associates Inc VAir Quality Grids VPresenation rollback control agg</li> <li>Latin Hypercube Points: 10</li> <li>Pollutant: PM25</li> <li>Year: 2000</li> <li>Threshold: 0.000000</li> <li>Selected Studies</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000 185-74; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000 185+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000 185+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000 185+; C0;</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000 175-84; C0;</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000 175-84; C0;</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000 175-84; C0;</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000 185+; C0;</li> <li>Lippmann</li></ul>	
Latin Hypercube Points: 10         Pollutant: PM2.5         Year: 2000         Threshold: 0.000000         Selected Studies <ul> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   65-74; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>Molgaveel</li> <li>Incidence Aggregation Level; State</li> </ul>	
Pollutari: PM2.5         Yea: 2000         Threshold: 0.000000         Selected Studies         ● Moolgavkar, 2000   55-74; C0; no ICD410         ● Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410         ● Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410         ● Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; C1; a         ● Lippmann et al., 2000   85	
Year: 2000         Threshold: 0.000000         ➡ Selected Studies         ■ Moolgavkar, 2000   65-74; C0; no ICD410         ■ Moolgavkar, 2000   75-84; C0; no ICD410         ■ Moolgavkar, 2000   75-84; C0; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410         ■ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410	
<ul> <li>Threshold: 0.000000</li> <li>Selected Studies</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   65-74; CD; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   75-84; CD; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   65-74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; O3 no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3 no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Selected Studies</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   65-74; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; C3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; C3; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   65-74; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; C0; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+703</li> <li>Lippmann et</li></ul>	
<ul> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   75-84; CO; no ICD410</li> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; CO; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; CO3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Moolgavkar, 2000   85+; CD; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+74; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+74; O3; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; O3; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85-74; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85-74; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85-74; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; 03</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   65-74; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> <li>□ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410</li> </ul>	
Elippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03     Elippmann et al., 2000   85-74; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD	
Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03     Elippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410     Advanced     Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
Elippmann et al., 2000   65-74; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410     Advanced     Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
Elippmann et al., 2000   75-84; 03; no ICD410     Elippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410     Advanced     Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
⊡ Lippmann et al., 2000   85+; 03; no ICD410 Advanced Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
- Advanced Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
Incidence Aggregation Level: State	
Taladion Agglogation Eotol: None	
Default Advanced Pooling Method: Round Weights to Two Digits	
Default Monte Carlo Iterations: 5000	
Random Seed: 378245560	
Dollar Year: 2000	
E - Pooling Tree 1	
😑 Hospital Admissions, Cardiovascular [Pooling Method: Random / Fixed Effects] [Advanced Pooling Method: Round Weights to Two Digits]	
😑 [Weight: 0.76, Mean: 3,067.60, StdDev: 3,196.05] Moolgavkar, HA, All Cardiovascular, 2000, Los Angeles, CA [Pooling Method: Sum (Dependent)]	
- 65, 74, 65-74; CO; no ICD410, All, All, CO, TwentyFourHourDailyAverage, (exp(Beta*DELTAQ)-1)*(Incidence-Incidence2)*POP, 1	
- 75, 84, 75-84; CO; no ICD410, All, All, CO, TwentyFourHourDailyAverage, (exp(Beta*DELTAQ)-1)*(Incidence-Incidence2)*POP, 1	
85, Max, 85+; CO; no ICD 410, All, All, CO, TwentyFourHourDailyAverage, (exp(Beta*DELTAQ)-1)*(Incidence-Incidence2)*POP, 1	
🚊 [Weight: 0.24, Mean: 9,084.97, StdDev: 5,747.26] Lippmann et al. [Pooling Method: Sum (Dependent)]	
⊞ HA, Congestive Heart Failure, 2000, Detroit, MI [Pooling Method: Sum (Dependent)]	
🗄 HA, Dysrhythmia, 2000, Detroit, MI [Pooling Method: Sum (Dependent)]	
🗄 HA, Ischemic Heart Disease, 2000, Detroit, MI [Pooling Method: Sum (Dependent)]	
Valuation Pooling Trees	

Export

OK

## Example International BenMAP Projects

- South Korea: Health benefits of Seoul air quality management plan
- Latin America: Benefits of air quality improvements in Mexico City, Saõ Paulo, Santiago
- India: Benefits analyses in Mumbai and Pune of alternate air quality policies

# Using BenMAP International

- Program components users must modify:
  - Baseline and projected population data
  - Monitoring data (if applicable)
  - Valuation function library
- BenMAP components users should consider modifying:
  - Concentration-response function library
  - Baseline and projected incidence rates
  - Income growth adjustment functions



## **Derivation of Effects Estimates**



Epidemiology studies – derivation of concentrationresponse functions (beta values)

### • Valuation Procedures (I) WTP reflects individuals' preferences

- Market goods e.g., buying a new automobile
- Non-market goods e.g., health-related improvements in environmental quality
- WTP for a non-market good difficult to estimate
  - Decrease the risk of a day of coughing
  - Decrease the risk of admission to the hospital for respiratory illness
- Benefits analysis estimates the value of a statistical health problem avoided
- Reduction in air pollutant concentrations results in a reduction in mortality risk

# Valuation Procedures (II)

- EXAMPLE: Value of a statistical life saved
  - I µg/m<sup>3</sup> reduction in pollutant concentration produces decrease in mortality risk of I/I0,000
    - For every 10,000 individuals, one individual would be expected to die in the absence of the reduction in PM concentrations
  - WTP for this 1/10,000 decrease in mortality risk is \$500
  - Value of a statistical life is 10,000 x \$500 = \$5 million
     International benefits transfer between countries