

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Local Government Advisory Committee (LGAC)

Meeting Summary

November 26, 2013
11:30a.m.-12:30pm ET

Teleconference

The meeting summary that follows reflects the general highlights of what was conveyed during the course of the meeting. The Committee is not responsible for any potential inaccuracies that may appear in the summary as a result of information conveyed. Moreover, the Committee advises that additional information sources be consulted in cases where any concern may exist about statistics or any other information contained within the minutes.

**Environmental Protection Agency
Local Government Advisory Committee
Full Committee Meeting**

**November 26, 2013
11:30 a.m.-12:30 p.m. ET**

Meeting Summary

I. Welcome and Introductions

A. Call to Order

Chairman Mayor Bob Dixson called the meeting to order and asked for a round of introductions. Chairman Dixson declared a quorum to conduct business of the Committee. The Chairman thanked the Committee Members, EPA staff (Headquarters and the Regions) and members of the public for joining the LGAC Teleconference. Chairman Dixson invited members of the public to speak during the allotted time on the agenda for public comments.

B. Meeting Purpose

Chairman Dixson stated the purpose of the meeting was to deliberate the EPA Charge to review and provide comments on the *Draft 2014-2018 EPA Strategic Plan*. Additionally, the purpose of the meeting was to deliberate and decide on the Small Community Advisory Subcommittee's (SCAS) letter of recommendation and the LGAC workgroups' four letters of recommendation. He also added that the meeting purpose was to deliberate these actions in an open and public meeting.

C. Chair's Opening Remarks

Chairman Dixson gave an overview of the Local Government Advisory Committee (LGAC). The LGAC is made up of a group of elected and appointed officials, appointed by the EPA Administrator. All members serve in a voluntary capacity and serve on behalf of their communities. The LGAC seeks to find common ground on environmental issues that are important to all communities. The LGAC represents "our neighbors, our friends, and future generations." Chairman Dixson also stated that he believes "that by serving we are making our communities a better place to live and work."

Chairman Dixson stated that "the partnership with the LGAC and EPA is important to all of us." He went on to say, that "the LGAC is a diverse committee, talented and committed to our communities. We are environmental stewards and we value EPA's mission."

Chairman Dixson stated that, "the EPA understands that one size does not fit all: What works in one community, or a small community, might not work in a large metropolitan area." The LGAC brings all of these perspectives together. He stated that EPA truly listens to the LGAC's advice and recommendations because the LGAC brings their on-the-ground and front line perspectives.

Chairman Dixon indicated that he wanted to provide background on this important partnership with EPA and local governments for the members of the public joining the meeting. He also stated that “this is the American people’s tax dollars at work, especially in hearing how we implement rules and regulations at the local level.”

**II. Remarks by Joyce Frank
Principal Deputy Associate Administrator, EPA’s Office of
Congressional and Intergovernmental Relations**

Joyce Frank thanked Chairman Dixon and Vice Chairman Carbajal for their outstanding leadership of the LGAC. She especially thanked the LGAC members for their work, their time to participate all through the year, and especially their time for this very important meeting.

She also welcomed members of the public who joined the teleconference. To the LGAC Members in particular, she acknowledged that the circumstances for conducting meetings has not been ideal without the ability to have face- to- face meetings.

She also acknowledged the very positive energy coming from the committee. She also expressed hope for the possibility to have a face- to- face meeting in early 2014. She also stated that she thinks this will be very beneficial for not only the work of the LGAC, but for the EPA, as well.

She also raised the issue that many of the LGAC members’ terms are expiring in December 2014. She thanked the many LGAC members who expressed interest in continued service through reappointment. She also indicated that we are currently working through that membership process and will hopefully receive feedback soon.

She acknowledged that there are a couple of members whose terms are up and the EPA would like to publicly acknowledge the service of Mayor Hosterman and Mayor Bellamy. She indicated that their work had been a great value to the work of the LGAC.

**III. Remarks of Mark Rupp
Deputy Associate Administrator
Intergovernmental Relations**

Mark Rupp thanked Joyce Frank for the introduction and thanked Chairman Dixon. He stated that it was a honor to introduce EPA’s Deputy Administrator Bob Perciasepe, “who is no stranger to the LGAC.” He began the introduction by saying that Bob Perciasepe had addressed the LGAC on several occasions and the more recent Administrative meeting in June, 2013 (while he was serving as Acting Administrator).

He also shared that how “heartening” it was to see the real partnership between Administrator Gina McCarthy and Deputy Administrator Bob Perciasepe as they lead EPA through a really difficult time with many unknowns and a lot of uncertainty about resources.

During the government-wide shutdown, the EPA was also shutdown and so were the activities

of the LGAC. He thanked everyone for their "incredible patience" during the government shutdown. He also stated what an honor it was to be back to work at the EPA, and to work with the Administrator and Deputy Administrator Bob Perciasepe.

IV. Remarks of the Bob Perciasepe, Deputy Administrator

A. Remarks

Deputy Administrator Bob Perciasepe thanked Mark Rupp for the introduction. He thanked Chairman, Mayor Dixon, Vice Chairman, Supervisor Carbajal, and all the members of the LGAC. He expressed his appreciation of their leadership on the committee.

He also thanked the LGAC members for joining the meeting and for all the work that the Committee had accomplished thus far. He stated that the work of the Committee was invaluable to the EPA, and "how very important it is to listen to local government perspectives in the work we do here at the EPA."

He also thanked Mayor (former) Bellamy, Asheville, North Carolina and Mayor (former) Hosterman, Pleasanton, California for their service on the Committee and the work they had accomplished in their role as mayors.

He went on to say that the committee represents communities from both sides of the continent. He also stated that, "he could not overemphasize the weight that EPA senior leaders place on local government opinions and that the LGAC is a key place for us to get that advice."

He also acknowledged members of this committee for their extended service to the federal government: Mayor Dixon, Supervisor Carbajal and Mayor Becker from Salt Lake City. These LGAC members have been recently appointed to the White House Task Force on Climate Preparedness and Resilience. He indicated that their first meeting of the Task Force was announced for December 10, 2013.

The Interagency Climate Change Council, the federal interagency group which supports this work, met on November 25, 2013. He indicated that "it really bodes well that there are three

(3)

members of the EPA's Local Government Advisory Committee that are on this presidential task force." He indicated that he is looking forward to their advice and recommendations.

He said that the Administrator and he had been working very hard together on formulating the EPA's key priorities which are contained in the *Draft 2014-2018 EPA Strategic Plan* (<http://www2.epa.gov/planandbudget/strategicplan>). He said that one of the exciting priorities that Administrator Gina McCarthy had put forward is a new Goal 5 to "create a new era of state, tribal and local partnerships."

He indicated that partnerships are not new to EPA. However, he said what is important "is that it is about ramping up and creating a different era of partnerships in the 21st century." He also stated that this offers a real opportunity to think differently about our partnerships.

He stated that Maryann Froehlich, the Acting Chief Financial Officer, would speak on the *Draft Strategic Plan*. He indicated that the *Draft Strategic Plan* is available for public comment. He also indicated that the EPA will develop action plans to go along with the *Strategic Plan*. He said that he was looking forward to the input of the LGAC on the *Strategic Plan*.

He indicated that another important area for the committee to focus is climate change adaptation. He said that the President's Task Force is well represented with the three LGAC Members. He said that the LGAC's advice is also needed at EPA on climate change adaptation and that the LGAC is well positioned to give advice.

He said that he wanted to turn to Chairman Mayor Dixon, as an example of that, and "what is at stake." He said the city of Greensburg, Kansas, faced and survived a catastrophic F-5 tornado. He said they did that by pulling together and looking toward what needed to be rebuilt. He said they also built back in new and different ways with new federal, state and private sector partners. He also noted that, "it did not happen by accident, but by his leadership and the grit of the folks in Greensburg, Kansas."

He said that not only have members of the LGAC lived through something like a catastrophic storm, but many are preparing for the next catastrophic event. Many are also learning from what has happened. "Whether it's in Kansas or in New York City or any other place subject to the extreme weather events, it will be valuable for the EPA to learn from these experiences," He said that he was looking forward to working with the LGAC on this.

The other priority issue where the EPA needs the LGAC's advice is –water infrastructure. Local governments and the EPA have evolved a partnership over the years (since the 1970's). Water infrastructure was a huge financial investment where the EPA provided about 75 percent of the cost to help local governments build water infrastructure. He said that a quick calculation of this investment was about \$5 billion EPA had given in 1973-1974, through water infrastructure grants. He said that investment in today's economy is approximately \$20 billion.

He said that, "if you think about a \$20 billion program in today's dollars is what we were running in the 1970's to try to get a boost on infrastructure. And indeed, every sewage treatment plant in the United States has been upgraded through that grant program."

He said that "we are in a different era where we have loan funds and we have to look at new ways to solve these problems." Green infrastructure is one of those ways for a potential path forward that is cost-effective and it provides more community amenities.

He indicated EPA recently sponsored a Green Infrastructure conference in Syracuse, New York, which addressed some innovative ways to use green infrastructure to control stormwater discharges (<http://syracusecoe.org/efc/events.html?skuvar=32>). He noted that two LGAC Members were a part of those discussions: Mayor Carolyn Peterson and Mr. Kevin Shafer. He mentioned that LGAC Members are from many different areas and have diverse representation from all over the country. He said that he was looking forward to hearing from the LGAC on their advice and recommendations.

He also mentioned that EPA's Office of Water's Acting Assistant Administrator Nancy Stoner had made a recent visit to the City of Laredo, Texas, to see the city's water infrastructure best practices. She also visited with LGAC Member, Dr. Hector Gonzalez, Director, Public Health for the City of Laredo, Texas. The city has been involved with looking at a comprehensive 50-year plan for water infrastructure. He said that it is "another great example of local planning efforts that leads to a good result."

He said a key thing to keep in mind is how we can use "working at the local level as an organizing principle" to help EPA coordinate its own programs. Whether it is a brownfields project, a storm water project, a combined sewer overflow project, or a local air pollution problem, the important thing is: "we have to work together for the benefit of everyone."

In the City of Little Rock, Arkansas, he had met with Mayor Mark Stodola, to discuss Sustainability best practices. The discussion focused on the Department of Transportation, the Department of Housing and Urban Development and the EPA coordinated programs for green infrastructure, brownfields clean up, and housing. These programs had worked together to help solve environmental problems but also contributed to their city's economic development plans.

He said that the EPA is poised to help in whatever way we can to work with the committee. He also stated how proud he was of EPA and all the work we're able to do "together" even under challenging budgetary times.

He also stated that in leading the EPA, he had similar experience of what local governments are facing in terms of "budgeting". He said that it is difficult to carry forward with the agency's operations without knowing what the budget is going to be especially after January 15, 2014.

He said that the EPA is finding ways to adapt. He said that it was a lot like climate adaptation. He stated how proud he is of the LGAC and their achievements. He said that "the committee is made up of an amazing cadre of people."

He also noted that everywhere he travels, whether it's the President's Task Force or a Green Infrastructure Conference, there were LGAC members participating. He commented that this means that the LGAC is well represented and a great committee for good advice and recommendations. Administrator McCarthy and he were both appreciative of their advice, and he looked forward to working with them.

B. Discussion

Chairman Mayor Dixon thanked the deputy administrator for his remarks and for all of his work at EPA. He also thanked him for recognizing the importance of the LGAC to the EPA.

Mayor Jennifer Hosterman thanked the deputy administrator for his "kind remarks to the committee" and his nice words for her service. She stated that, "it has been an absolute pleasure and honor to serve with all of the committee members." She also indicated that she

would like to participate in LGAC workgroup discussions. She said that, “ it had been a pleasure working with the deputy administrator, first, as mayor of the city of Pleasanton, California, but also in serving on the Mayor’s Water Council of the U.S. Conference of Mayors (USCM). “

Deputy Administrator Bob Perciasepe acknowledged that there had been great progress and that he hoped that guidance to the EPA would continue.

C. Remarks by Acting Region 4 Administrator Stan Meiburg

Chairman Mayor Bob Dixson acknowledged the EPA Acting Region 4 Administrator Stan Meiburg . He thanked the Chairman and Mark Rupp for this opportunity to speak to the LGAC.

He stated that he would like to speak in regard to Mayor Terry Bellamy’s service on the LGAC. He thanked her for serving and “bringing our regional perspective.” He said that the city of Asheville, North Carolina, under her leadership, is a “great center for coordination.” He said that he met with Mayor Bellamy in the summer to discuss partnerships for sustainable communities. He said that there had been great work with the HUD, the Department of Transportation and the EPA Brownfield’s work in the city of Asheville. He also said “that this progress could not have been accomplished without the leadership of extraordinary individuals like Mayor Bellamy.” He also thanked her for her service on the LGAC and for sharing that leadership with others: “We are very, very grateful.” He also thanked the Chairman and Mark Rupp for this opportunity to say “thank you” and for giving me a chance to support the LGAC.

Mayor Terry Bellamy thanked everyone for the kind words and said that she really appreciated it. She also stated that it had been a pleasure serving on the LGAC.

V. Maryann Froehlich, Acting Chief Financial Officer

A. Remarks

Acting Financial Officer Maryann Froehlich thanked Chairman Dixson for the opportunity to speak to the committee. She said that the discussion at the December 6th Executive Committee had been a good discussion on the *Draft 2014-2018 EPA Strategic Plan*, especially in preparing the committee for review and comments.

She said that it is always a pleasure to meet with the full committee and to give an overview of the *Draft Strategic Plan*. She said the one important and key message is that, “we really want to invite the engagement of the LGAC in development of this Plan.”

In the *Draft Strategic Plan*, there is a *new* focus on communities and in local governments. She stated that this is why it is really important for the LGAC to engage and provide the agency with their comments.

She outlined the goals of the *Draft Strategic Plan* and said that it describes the environmental

and human health results that EPA is working to achieve and the strategies to achieve them. It is authorized under the Government Performance and Results Act (GPPRA). It is prepared every four years at the beginning of a new presidential term. The Plan will be out in February, 2014.

The availability of the Strategic Plan was published on November 19th in the Federal Register <https://www.federalregister.gov/articles/2013/11/19/2013-27676/draft-fy-2014-2018-epa-strategic-plan-availability>. The comment period runs through January 3, 2014. She stated that the agency has valued the input and the feedback from the LGAC in the past, and "EPA wants to get that local government perspective, and there's no one better than this advisory committee for giving us that."

The structure of the Plan is not very much different from the last *FY11 to FY15 Strategic Plan*. It has five goals and it has cross-cutting strategies. 'Cross-cutting strategies' is a new goal and it provides what we do to incentivize and encourage cross-agency approaches to strengthen the way that EPA works.

Five strategic goals have been retained, but presented slightly different. The five goals mirror the basic environmental statutes that EPA implements with the states and in local communities. The five goals are: addressing climate change and improving air quality; protecting America's waters; cleaning up our communities and advancing sustainable development; ensuring the safety of chemicals and preventing pollution; and protecting human health in the environment by enforcing laws and assuring compliance.

Another thing that is added in those five goals is an emphasis on sustainability. Since Administrator McCarthy's confirmation there has been a focus to incorporate and highlight her seven themes for the agency. The seven themes are: 1) making a visible difference in communities across the country, 2) addressing climate change and improving air quality 3) taking action on toxics and chemical safety; 4) protecting water, a precious limited resource; 5) launching a new era of state, tribal and local partnerships; 6) embracing EPA as a high-performing organization; and 7) working towards a sustainable future.

She said that the number of EPA goals was reduced by adding the cross-cutting strategy. Research was incorporated in every one of the cross-cutting strategies. There is a section added on research as it relates to air, water, waste or any of the other goals.

The goal of working toward a sustainable future was called "expanding the conversation on environmentalism" (in the previous Strategic Plan). This theme was broadened. The prior *Strategic Plan FY2011-2015* focused on environmental justice (EJ). EPA has made progress in that area. The focus now is to empower a broader range of stakeholders, including groups with which EPA has not traditionally worked with, using multiple forms of outreach, collaboration and information-sharing. These groups will include federal, state and local agencies, tribes, agricultural manufacturing sectors, small businesses, industry, NGOs, the research community, international organizations, communities with environmental justice concerns, and other partners, both urban and rural, including those who have been under-represented to achieve more innovative and sustainable outcomes.

Another cross-cutting goal "working towards a sustainable future" incorporates sustainability

principles, into everything EPA does and in regulatory enforcement, and incentive-based partnership programs.

Another new one is “working to make a difference in communities” which should be of interest to the LGAC. It maintains the focus on environmental justice and children’s health. It also includes citizen engagement, sound science and some research efforts from the former cross-cutting strategy on research.

It also commits EPA to doing a better job of aligning community-based activities to provide more assistance to communities -both urban and rural. The goal is set to enhance the resiliency, health and economic vitality of neighborhoods. It also focuses on sound science and better community engagement while continuing to advance EJ and the protection of basic fundamental rights.

Resiliency and climate adaptation are also important, especially how it relates to water infrastructure. So it will become evident here that, “what we are working towards is doing more in communities.”

The next one is “launching a new era of state, tribal and local and international partnerships.” This one adds an explicit focus on the local element. She said that it acknowledges the unique relationship with EPA and local governments. As the EPA advisory committee focused on local governments, she said that, “we are looking at you both as co-implementers and as co-regulated entities under our national and state environmental laws.”

She said that she is looking for consistent communication with local officials. She said the agency is also working to consult with local governments on rules and policies under EPA’s action plan development to promote and to facilitate best practices that you have learned as local officials to address local environmental concerns.

The last cross-cutting strategy, is “embracing EPA as a high-performing organization.” This addresses internal EPA issues with a focus on streamlining our internal business and decision-making processes. It will also highlight enterprise efforts.

So why should you care about the *EPA Strategic Plan*? It is a very high level Plan because it is strategic and it will carry the agency’s actions over the next four years.” It serves as a roadmap for -how and where- we want to be at the end of those four years in partnership with local governments.”

So how does it affect you? If it’s high level, why would you care? The *Strategic Plan* is used by EPA to operationalize it, through annual action plans, which are coming out of the cross-cutting strategies. Those plans are under development and will be made final in FY14.

Additionally, there are measures under the goals, which are submitted with the annual budget. EPA is very interested in LGAC feedback, and “We really value the unique perspective from where you sit as a local community leader and particularly, as elected/appointed officials.”

The Administrator and deputy administrator have said many times that, "communities are our organizing principle and where our environmental laws get implemented."

The LGAC's comments, suggestions, advice and recommendations were invited. She thanked Chairman, Mayor Dixon, and the committee.

B. Discussion

Chairman Mayor Bob Dixon thanked Maryann Froehlich. Commissioner Robert Cope was recognized and stated that the Small Community Advisory Subcommittee (SCAS) discussed the *Draft Strategic Plan* in an earlier meeting. He expressed the desire to make a motion to delegate this letter of recommendation to the Executive Committee (by input from the SCAS and the work groups). (Mayor Bob Dixon indicated that the motion would be tabled to the business part of the meeting. Commissioner Cope withdrew the motion).

Commissioner Cope also had a personal comment to add that he had wanted to see a means for assessment and monitoring of the goals and objectives through adaptive management. He stated that he thought this might be missing in this strategic plan. He said what was needed are "real numbers and some benchmarks and trigger mechanisms." He said that, "if adaptive management was worked into the plan, it could be readily adapted for another four years."

Maryann Froehlich responded to Commissioner Cope's comment by saying that, "it is music to my ears, and as the acting CFO, we want to do performance and planning." She said, "what we absolutely live by is making sure that what we do is quantitative and measurable." She indicated the *Draft Strategic Plan* has strategic measures which relate to the goals. She said that it also contains benchmarks for EPA "to be there by a certain time."

She said this is contained within the annual planning process, and that there would be markers and measures both in the action plans and in the cross-cutting strategies and goals. She also reiterated that it is not only a strategic plan, but also an annual operating plan- of how and what-we're doing as an agency. She stated that the committee may want to review the action plan for the cross-cutting strategies.

Commissioner Cope thanked Maryann Froehlich for that response and said that the SCAS had discussed the need to add adaptive management as a recommendation.

Mayor Jennifer Hosterman said that she agrees with the discussion. She said that a way to really make this work for local government is it has to be part of "our discussions." If local governments develop similar timelines for elements in the area of water protection, in the area of climate change, and in the area of healthy communities, it might be an opportunity for local government to take those timelines as strategies." She said it could also be used as an opportunity to formulate their own general plans.

Mayor Hosterman stated that it does two things: It provides for that relationship between the federal government and local government and it elevates the EPA as a leader in showcasing how local governments can change and move forward. She also said that 'adaptation' is important in all of these areas.

Mayor Elizabeth Kautz commented that she appreciated the work that staff has done on the *Draft Strategic Plan*. She also stated that she appreciates all the background material that allowed the LGAC to prepare for this meeting. She also indicated that she was “really happy that we are moving in this direction.” Mayor Kautz also highlighted that there is a cost of some of the strategies. Mandates and funding are an issue for smaller communities to absorb these costs with today’s rates.

Mayor Dixon thanked Maryann Froehlich for her presentation and for seeking LGAC ‘s comments. Mayor Dixon stated that the *Draft Strategic Plan* would be deliberated in the business part of the meeting. He also stated that the committee would take whatever time needed to discuss and get input from LGAC on the *Draft Strategic Plan*.

VI. Public Comments

Chairman Dixon acknowledged and invited members of the public to address the committee. He stated the importance of the public involvement in the LGAC meeting. He also stated that written comments could also be submitted to Frances Eargle, the designated federal officer for the LGAC. He thanked members of the public for participating. No public presenters came forward to speak.

VII. Business Meeting

Chairman Mayor Bob Dixon indicated that this is the time on the agenda for the committee to deliberate and review committee actions. All of the letters of recommendation would be discussed and decided upon by action of the full committee in this public meeting. *The Draft Strategic Plan*, because of its cross-cutting issues, was discussed within the Executive Committee. However, Commissioner Cope has discussed that SCAS would like to move a motion on the *Draft Strategic Plan*.

A. Small Community Advisory Subcommittee (SCAS)

Chairman Dixon opened the discussion by acknowledging Chairman Commissioner Cope of the SCAS to discuss the *Draft EPA Strategic Plan*. Chairman Dixon made the observation that the LGAC work groups and the SCAS have had meetings to discuss and make recommendations regarding the *Draft Strategic Plan*.

The Executive Committee (EC) is made up of the work group chairs and vice chairs and the SCAS chair. He opened the discussion for the full committee to discuss comments on the *Draft EPA Strategic Plan*.

Dr. Hector Gonzalez was recognized and made a second to the motion made by Commissioner Cope made earlier. He said that, “*the Strategic Plan* is important.” He also stated that there were important comments made by the LGAC on some very important issues.

Dr. Gonzalez also stated that providing good examples of sustainability for small communities and local governments are important. He stated that he thought the Draft LGAC letters have good recommendations and good models put forward.

Commissioner Cope reinstated the motion for the LGAC to delegate drafting of the comments on the *Draft Strategic Plan* to the Executive Committee (EC) and for the EC to prepare a letter of recommendation on *EPA's Draft Strategic Plan*. It was seconded by Dr. Gonzalez. He called for discussion. There was none. He called for the question to accept the motion, all said, "Aye."

Chairman Mayor Bob Dixon encouraged the LGAC to provide comments through the work group process or through individual comments. He asked all LGAC members to review and provide comments.

Commissioner Robert Cope, SCAS Chairman, reported out that the SCAS had met in the previous hour in a public teleconference and puts forward a recommendation letter on small community water infrastructure.

Secondly, the SCAS reviewed three letters from the Air, Climate and Energy Committee and endorsed these actions. The letter of recommendation on brownfields and job training program, the SCAS reviewed and would put forth a friendly amendment (during that discussion).

Chairman Dixon called for discussion on the action. Ms. Sue Hann, Chairwoman, of the Protecting America's Waters Work Group indicated that the workgroup would like to co-sign the letter. Commissioner Cope indicated that her signature was contained in the Draft letter.

Chairman Dixon called for a motion to accept the small community water infrastructure letter of recommendation. Commissioner Cope put forward the motion. It was seconded by Mayor Peterson.

Chairman Dixon called for the question to accept the motion. All said, "Aye".

Chairman Dixon thanked Commissioner Cope and the SCAS for their work on behalf of all small communities.

B. Air, Climate and Energy Work Group

Vice-chairwoman Mayor Carolyn Peterson presented the three letters of recommendation for the workgroup. Mayor Peterson thanked all the other work groups who gave input to the letters, as well as the Executive Committee. She indicated that the workgroup had worked hard on these letters as well as other workgroups who gave input.

i) Climate Action Plan Letter of Recommendation-This letter gives a very broad overview on the on the *President's Climate Action Plan*. It also states the availability of the LGAC to give ongoing advice and recommendations. A new paragraph was added which mentions the three LGAC

members who were appointed to the Task Force on Climate Preparedness. It is a general letter stating the LGAC's broad comments and overview. There will be additional work in the future on very specific issues about the *Climate Action Plan*. Mayor Peterson also indicated that the workgroup wants to present that the LGAC "is eager and ready to work on climate change issues".

Mayor Jennifer Hosterman discussed the issue. She said that in the State of California (under AB32 from 2006), climate action plans are mandated to show how emissions will be reduced in the coming years. She indicated that there had been numerous years in putting language together. In the city of Pleasanton, California, it was particularly difficult because the city is located on the U.S. 586/80 corridor, where total emissions are at 55 percent from that transit location. A climate action plan was developed. She said that she would like to make that available to the LGAC. She indicated that, "it is not the end all, but it is the beginning of a climate action plan."

Chairman Dixon asked for any further discussion. He confirmed that Mayor Peterson made a motion on the letter. Commissioner Don Larson seconded the motion. All said, "Aye".

ii) Near Roadway Letter of Recommendation-Mayor Peterson indicated that this letter had been significantly reworked by the LGAC Environmental Justice Workgroup. Dr. Gonzalez added a great amount of supportive documentation on public health impacts. The Executive Committee expressed concerns about the outcome of this kind of letter. Therefore, the focus of the letter was changed to focus on the importance of having air quality monitoring data for local government planning decisions. The letter was taken up by the EJ Workgroup and rewritten by recommendation of the Executive Committee.

Chairman Dixon called for discussion and acknowledged Dr. Gonzalez, Vice-chair of the EJ Workgroup, (and cosigner of the recommendation letter) to give his perspective.

Dr. Hector Gonzalez asked if Mayor Wong would like to make a statement. Mayor Lisa Wong, Chairwoman of the EJ Workgroup stated that, "a great job had been done on all of the letters." She stated that she concurred with Mayor Peterson on the level of engagement on these letters and the hard work that went into compiling them. She indicated the important involvement of Dr. Gonzalez and how it could not have been accomplished without his input. Mayor Wong asked Dr. Gonzalez to speak on the action.

Dr. Gonzalez thanked Mayor Wong and everyone on the committee. He concurred with Mayor Wong that all the workgroups had done "an especially good job on the Near Roadway letter." Commissioner Cope's subcommittee (SCAS) added very good input as well as the Executive Committee. All of the comments had been incorporated.

Dr. Gonzalez stated that he added more detail on the health impacts. He gave congratulations to all of the committee on this effort. He said that this letter had the most to offer into the comments of the *Strategic Plan*, where there are already some recommendations. He also noted that it is most reflective of the work with local communities on sustainability and that was emphasized in the call to set markers for progress and milestones.

Chairman Dixon stated that he particularly appreciated the collaboration by all of the workgroups on cross-cutting issues of the committee. He stated that, "it is just tremendous work and very rewarding" from his viewpoint to see how these issues have been addressed. He thanked everyone for their work.

Mayor Peterson made a motion to accept the letter. Mr. Jeff Tiberi seconded the motion. All said, "Aye".

iii) EPA's Air Advance Letter of Recommendation-Mayor Peterson presented the letter of recommendation on the EPA's Air Advance Programs for ozone and particulate matter. This letter was expanded and adjusted to reflect the committee members' concerns. And again, there is a great deal of health information with citations added to the letter.

Mayor Peterson made a motion to accept the letter. Commissioner Don Larson made a second to the motion. All said, "Aye".

C. Protecting America's Waters Work group

Chairwoman Sue Hann led a discussion on the workgroups efforts. She echoed the remarks which had been made on how all of the workgroups worked together on these letters.

Chairwoman Sue Hann also indicated that the workgroup had met three weeks prior to discuss lead and copper in drinking water. She indicated this is an important issue for local governments and that there would likely be action coming forward to the committee soon.

She also noted that the Water workgroup was putting together comments at their next meeting on the *Draft Strategic Plan*. She also indicated that the workgroup heard presentations by Mr. Kevin Shafer and Mayor Peterson regarding the community summit on green infrastructure and looked forward to the proceedings of this conference. She said that there was a robust agenda last month and she anticipated spending time on the agenda on the *Draft Strategic Plan*.

Chairman Dixon thanked Chairwoman Sue Hann and Vice-Chairwoman Mayor Kautz. Mayor Kautz added that Chairwoman Sue Hann had done a great job of reporting out for the workgroup.

D. Expanding the Conversation (EJ) Work Group

Mayor Lisa Wong, Chairwoman of the workgroup and Dr. Hector Gonzalez, Vice-chair thanked everyone. Mayor Wong indicated that the workgroup had reviewed a number of letters coming forward from the different work groups. Mayor Wong indicated that she and Dr. Gonzalez were moving forward the "expanded conversation of EJ" by inserting language in all of the letters to consider environmental justice, which is important to the LGAC.

The work group's focus is elevating the issue of the gap in health disparities of EJ communities along with addressing the disproportionate risk factors for EJ communities. The Workgroup

made a substantial rewrite of the Near Roadway letter of recommendation, by request of the Executive Committee on November 5th.

The Near Roadway letter not only addresses the EPA monitoring program which establishes air quality monitoring stations near the communities most impacted by air pollution, but also acknowledges broader EJ issues. Mayor Wong also said that the Near Roadway letter raises awareness of the importance of this issue. The Workgroup added recommendations to incorporate public health concerns and added a discussion on the issue of multiple stressors for vulnerable populations.

Dr. Gonzalez thanked Mayor Wong for her leadership. Mayor Wong also stated that the issue of brownfields is important for workforce development and training and is important to EJ communities. She indicated that as mayor of the city of Fitchburg, Massachusetts, that the first introduction to the EPA over a decade ago was through the city's brownfields work.

Mayor Wong indicated that green jobs and the work force development are important. She said that this may be a way to connect our local concerns with EPA policies "for a big impact on the community." She said positive impacts are related to a healthy economy, as well as, a healthy work force, and that they serve to change the conversation from "regulation" to positive impacts on communities.

The Workgroup also discussed risk assessment and the gap in health disparities. One of the ways discussed was to connect work force training opportunities. It is not just a top down approach, but something communities could be challenged to address with their own issues. There are some examples discussed around the country especially near the U.S-Mexico Border:

Chairman Dixson thanked Mayor Wong and Dr. Gonzalez for their work and report out.

E. Cleaning Up Communities

Vice-Chairwoman Councilor Jill Duson stated that she would present for Chairwoman Mayor Bellamy (who had left the teleconference). Vice-Chairwoman Duson thanked everyone for their input and she expressed appreciation for Mayor Wong's comments regarding the brownfields letter . She indicated that the letter had been reviewed by the Executive Committee and the SCAS .

She indicated that she echoed the comments of LGAC colleagues that, " it was really both an excellent learning experience and team work to work across committees on producing this work."

The letter of recommendation supports the EPA Brownfields program and specifically addresses the environmental work force development and job training program. It gives clarity that local communities are "a broad constituency for the respective programs and it highlights how useful these programs have been to our communities."

Vice-Chairwoman asked if there were additional comments on the Brownfields letter before a

motion would be offered. Mayor Peterson indicated that the SCAS had one amendment. Commissioner Cope stated that the SCAS wanted to add the following recommendation: "The LGAC supports the EPA's provisions and the Brownfields program for training operators of small waste water systems and recommends that EPA should widely disseminate information regarding this program."

Vice-Chairwoman Duson indicated that the Workgroup had agreed to that language and there were no concerns with adding this language. Commissioner Cope made a motion to accept the letter with the SCAS friendly amendment. Councilor Duson seconded the action. All said, "Aye".

Chairman Dixson thanked Mayor Bellamy and Councilor Duson for their input and their work for the entire committee. Councilor Duson stated that, "she did not want to miss the opportunity to personally express strong appreciation for the work of Mayor Bellamy as chairwoman of the Cleaning Up Communities Workgroup, and her help in moving this work forward."

Chairman Dixson thanked Councilor Duson and Mayor Bellamy.

VIII. Concluding Remarks

Chairman Dixson acknowledged that it was time for the meeting to close. He echoed 'thanks' to Mayor Jennifer Hosterman and Mayor Terry Bellamy for their dedicated service to the LGAC

Chairman Dixson thanked all the presenters, especially Deputy Administrator Bob Perciasepe and Acting Chief Financial Officer Maryann Froehlich. He also thanked Joyce Frank, Mark Rupp and Jack Bowles and everyone on the teleconference.

Chairman Dixson acknowledged Mark Rupp to make closing remarks. Mark Rupp thanked Chairman Dixson and everyone serving on the LGAC "for their extraordinary work". He said that this work had been accomplished in a very short window of time and that it exceeded all expectations. He also expressed that he was looking forward to the next full LGAC meeting in person.

Chairman Dixson thanked Mark Rupp for his closing remarks. He said that he appreciated all the time and support to all of the EPA staff that helped the LGAC, work groups and SCAS. He thanked everyone on the LGAC. He stated that it was a "real honor to serve with his LGAC colleagues." He goes on to say that, "it was an honor to serve with those who make each one of our communities a better place for each of us to live and work." He thanked everyone for a wonderful and productive meeting. He wished everyone a happy and wonderful Thanksgiving with family and friends.

IX. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 12:34 p.m. ET.

Submitted: _____

Frances Eargle, DFO

Date: Jan 5, 2019

Approved: _____

LGAC, Chair

Date: Jan 5, 2019

LGAC Meeting Participants:

LGAC Members:

Mayor Bob Dixson, Chair
Commissioner Robert Cope, Chair, SCAS
Mayor Terry Bellamy
Mayor Alvin Brown
Councilmember Cindy Circo
Councilor Jill Duson
Commissioner Jay Fisette
Dr. Hector Gonzalez, MD
Ms. Sue Hann
Mayor Jennifer Hosterman
Mayor Elizabeth Kautz
Commissioner Don Larson
Mayor Carolyn Peterson
Mr. Kevin Shafer
Councilor Dave Somers
Mr. Jeff Tiberi

EPA Staff:

Bob Perciasepe, Deputy Administrator
Maryann Froehlich, Acting Chief Financial Officer
Stan Meiburg, Acting EPA Region 4 Administrator
Joyce Frank, Principal Deputy Associate Administrator, OCIR
Mark Rupp, Deputy Associate Administrator, Intergovernmental Relations
Jack Bowles, Director, State and Local
Frances Eargle, DFO
Becky Cook-Shyovitz, OCIR
Anita Cummings, OSWER
Kellie Kubena, OWM

Jim Horne, OWM
Vivian Daub, OCFO
Barbara Rosing, OCFO
Shea Johnson, EPA Region 4

Public Participants:

Tara Velms, Patton Boggs, LLC
Darrell Osterhoudt, Association of State Drinking Water Agencies
Randy Showstack, American Geophysical Union
Mark Wolinski, City of Roseville, CA
Kathy Peese, City of Roseville, CA
Stuart Parker, Inside EPA