

BEFORE THE  
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

In the Matter of:

CODY KARST

Pinehurst, Idaho

Respondent.

DOCKET NO. CWA-10-2022-0027

**CONSENT AGREEMENT**

Proceedings Under Section 309(g) of the Clean Water Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)

**I. STATUTORY AUTHORITY**

1.1. This Consent Agreement is entered into under the authority vested in the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) by Section 309(g) of the Clean Water Act (CWA), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g).

1.2. Pursuant to CWA Section 309(g)(1)(A), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(1)(A), EPA is authorized to assess a civil penalty against any person that has violated CWA Section 301, 33 U.S.C. § 1311.

1.3. CWA Section 309(g)(2)(B), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(2)(B), authorizes the administrative assessment of Class II civil penalties in an amount not to exceed \$10,000 per day for each day during which the violation continues, up to a maximum penalty of \$125,000. Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Part 19, the administrative assessment of Class II civil penalties may not exceed \$22,584 per day for each day during which the violation continues, up to a maximum penalty of \$282,293. *See also* 85 Fed. Reg. 83818 (December 23, 2020) (2021 Civil Monetary Penalty Inflation Adjustment Rule).

1.4. Pursuant to CWA Section 309(g)(1)(A) and (g)(2)(B), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(1)(A) and (g)(2)(B), and in accordance with Section 22.18 of the “Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties,” 40 C.F.R. Part 22, EPA issues,

and Cody Karst (Respondent) agrees to issuance of, the Final Order attached to this Consent Agreement.

## **II. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT**

2.1. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b) and 22.18(b), execution of this Consent Agreement commences this proceeding, which will conclude when the Final Order becomes effective.

2.2. The Administrator has delegated the authority to sign consent agreements between EPA and the party against whom a penalty is proposed to be assessed pursuant to CWA Section 309(g), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g), to the Regional Administrator of EPA Region 10, who has redelegated this authority to the Director of the Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division, EPA Region 10 (Complainant).

2.3. Part III of this Consent Agreement contains a concise statement of the factual and legal basis for the alleged violations of the CWA, together with the specific provisions of the CWA and implementing regulations that Respondent is alleged to have violated.

## **III. ALLEGATIONS**

### **Statutory and Regulatory Framework**

3.1. As provided in CWA Section 101(a), 33 U.S.C. § 1251(a), the objective of the CWA is “to restore and maintain the chemical, physical, and biological integrity of the Nation’s waters.”

3.2. CWA Section 301(a), 33 U.S.C. § 1311(a), prohibits the discharge of pollutants by any person from any point source into waters of the United States except, *inter alia*, as authorized by a National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit issued pursuant to CWA Section 402, 33 U.S.C. § 1342, or Department of Army permit issued by the

United States Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) pursuant to CWA section 404, 33 U.S.C. § 1344.

3.3. CWA Section 402(p)(2)(B) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1342(p)(2)(B), states that stormwater discharges “associated with industrial activity” require NPDES permit coverage. 40 C.F.R. § 122.26 requires stormwater discharges associated with construction activities, including clearing, grading, and excavating in a manner that result in land disturbance of equal to or greater than one acre, to be authorized by a NPDES permit.

3.4. CWA Section 502(12), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(12), defines the term “discharge of a pollutant” to include “any addition of any pollutant to navigable waters from any point source.”

3.5. CWA Section 502(7) defines “navigable waters” as “the waters of the United States, including the territorial seas.” 33 U.S.C. § 1362(7). In turn, “waters of the United States” is defined to include, *inter alia*, all waters which are currently used, were used in the past, or may be susceptible to use in interstate or foreign commerce, including all waters which are subject to the ebb and flow of the tide; tributaries to such waters; and wetlands adjacent to the foregoing waters. 40 C.F.R. § 120.2 (June 22, 2020).

3.6. A “point source” includes, *inter alia*, “any discernible, confined and discrete conveyance, including but not limited to any pipe, ditch, channel, tunnel, conduit, well, discrete fissure, [or] container ... from which pollutants are or may be discharged.” CWA Section 502(14), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(14).

3.7. A “pollutant” includes, *inter alia*, rock, sand, biological materials, dredged spoil, and solid waste discharged into water. CWA Section 502(6), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(6).

3.8. “Fill material” includes material placed in waters of the United States where the material has the effect of replacing any portion of a water of the United States with dry land, or changing the bottom elevation of any portion of a water of the United States. Examples of fill material include rock, sand, soil, clay, construction debris, wood chips and debris, overburden

from excavation activities, and materials used to create any structure or infrastructure in the waters of the United States. 40 C.F.R. § 232.2.

3.9. Each discharge of pollutants from a point source that is not authorized by a permit issued pursuant to the CWA constitutes a violation of CWA Section 301(a), 33 U.S.C. § 1311(a).

### **General Allegations**

3.10. Respondent is an individual and a “person” under CWA Section 502(5), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(5).

3.11. At all times relevant to this action, Respondent directed work to be performed on property owned by Mr. Josh Weaver, Ms. Rachel Weaver, and Respondent located on land adjacent to the South Fork of the Coeur d’Alene River and Pine Creek within SE¼ NE¼ of Section 32, Township 49 North, Range 02 East in Shoshone County, Idaho within the Bunker Hill Metallurgical Complex Superfund Site. The subject property address is 108 South Fork Lane in Pinehurst, Idaho (“Site”).

3.12. Pine Creek is a perennial tributary to the South Fork of the Coeur d’Alene River. The South Fork of the Coeur d’Alene River is a perennial tributary to the Coeur d’Alene River, which is a perennial tributary to Lake Coeur d’Alene. Lake Coeur d’Alene is a traditional navigable water and a Water of the United States. As such, Pine Creek, the South Fork of the Coeur d’Alene River, and adjacent wetlands are “navigable waters” within the meaning of CWA Section 502(7), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(7), and are “waters of the United States” within the meaning of 40 C.F.R. § 120.2 (June 22, 2020).

3.13. In or around July, August, and September 2020, Respondent and/or persons acting on its behalf used certain heavy earthmoving equipment to relocate and discharge dredged and/or fill material, including stream bed cobble rock, sediment, mine tailings, mine-contaminated sediment, soil, and other native materials, below the ordinary high water mark of Pine Creek, below the ordinary high water mark of the South Fork of the Coeur d’Alene River, and into

wetlands adjacent to Pine Creek and the South Fork of the Coeur d'Alene River.

3.14. The dredged and/or fill material that Respondent and/or persons acting on its behalf caused to be discharged, include stream bed cobble rock, sediment, mine tailings, mine waste-contaminated sediment, soil, and other native materials, each of which constitutes “dredged material” and/or “fill material” within the meaning of 40 C.F.R. § 232.2, and each of which constitutes a “pollutant” within the meaning of CWA Section 502(6), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(6). By causing such dredged and/or fill materials to enter waters of the United States, Respondent engaged in the “discharge of pollutants” from a point source within the meaning of CWA Sections 301(a) and 502(12), 33 U.S.C. §§ 1311(a) and 1362(12).

3.15. In or around July, August, and September 2020, Respondent and/or persons acting on its behalf cleared, graded, and/or excavated in a manner that resulted in land disturbance of equal to or greater than one acre at the Site using certain heavy earthmoving equipment. These activities resulted in stormwater discharges associated with industrial activity from the Site.

3.16. The equipment referenced in Paragraphs 3.13 and 3.15 is a “point source” within the meaning of CWA Section 502(14), 33 U.S.C. § 1362(14).

3.17. Respondent’s discharge of dredged and/or fill material described in Paragraphs 3.13 and 3.14 was not authorized by any permit issued pursuant to CWA Section 404, 33 U.S.C. § 1344. Additionally, Respondent’s activities described in Paragraph 3.15 resulted in stormwater discharges associated with industrial activity from the Site without authorization by any NPDES permit issued pursuant to CWA Section 402, 33 U.S.C. § 1342. Respondent is therefore in violation of CWA Section 301(a), 33 U.S.C. § 1311(a).

3.18. Respondent has discharged pollutants from a point source into waters of the United States at the Site, within the meaning of Section 502(7) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1362(7).

#### **IV. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT**

4.1. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations contained in this Consent Agreement.

4.2. Respondent neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations contained in this Consent Agreement.

4.3. As required by CWA Section 309(g)(3), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(3), EPA has taken into account “the nature, circumstances, extent and gravity of the violation, or violations, and, with respect to the violator, ability to pay, any prior history of such violations, the degree of culpability, economic benefit or savings (if any) resulting from the violation, and such other matters as justice may require.” After considering all of these factors as they apply to this case, EPA has determined that an appropriate penalty to settle this action is \$14,000.

4.4. Respondent consents to the assessment of the civil penalty set forth in Paragraph 4.3 and agrees to pay the total civil penalty with interest, at the current rate of three percent per annum as established by the United States Department of Treasury, within one hundred eighty (180) days of the effective date of the Final Order.

4.5. Payment under this Consent Agreement and the Final Order may be paid by check (mail or overnight delivery), wire transfer, ACH, or online payment. Payment instructions are available at: <http://www2.epa.gov/financial/makepayment>. Payments made by a cashier’s check or certified check must be payable to the order of “Treasurer, United States of America” and delivered to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Fines and Penalties  
Cincinnati Finance Center  
P.O. Box 979077  
St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

Respondent must note on the check the title and docket number of this action.

4.6. Respondent must serve photocopies of the check, or proof of other payment method described in Paragraph 4.5, on the Regional Hearing Clerk and EPA Region 10

Compliance Officer at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Region 10, Mail Stop 11-C07  
1200 Sixth Avenue, Suite 155  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
[R10\\_RHC@epa.gov](mailto:R10_RHC@epa.gov)

Charissa Bujak  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Region 10, Idaho Operations Office  
950 West Bannock Street  
Boise, Idaho 83702  
[Bujak.charissa@epa.gov](mailto:Bujak.charissa@epa.gov)

4.7. If Respondent fails to pay the penalty assessed by this Consent Agreement in full by its due date, the entire unpaid balance of penalty and accrued interest shall become immediately due and owing. Such failure may also subject Respondent to a civil action to collect the assessed penalty under the CWA, together with interest, fees, costs, and additional penalties described below. In any collection action, the validity, amount, and appropriateness of the penalty shall not be subject to review.

a. Interest. Pursuant to CWA Section 309(g)(9), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(9), any unpaid portion of the assessed penalty shall bear interest at a rate established by the Secretary of Treasury pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(a)(1) from the effective date of the Final Order set forth in Part V, provided however, that no interest shall be payable on any portion of the assessed penalty that is paid within 30 days of the effective date of the Final Order.

b. Attorneys Fees, Collection Costs, Nonpayment Penalty. Pursuant to CWA Section 309(g)(9), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(9), if Respondent fails to pay on a timely basis the penalty set forth in Paragraph 4.3, Respondent shall pay (in addition to any assessed penalty and interest) attorneys fees and costs for collection proceedings and a quarterly nonpayment penalty for each quarter during which such failure to pay persists. Such nonpayment penalty shall be in an amount equal to 20% of the aggregate amount of Respondent's penalties and

nonpayment penalties which are unpaid as of the beginning of such quarter.

4.8. The penalty described in Paragraph 4.3, including any additional expenses incurred under Paragraph 4.7, above, represents an administrative civil penalty assessed by EPA and shall not be deductible for purposes of federal taxes.

4.9. The undersigned representative of Respondent certifies that they are authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Agreement and to bind Respondent to this document.

4.10. The undersigned representative of Respondent also certifies that, as of the date of Respondent's signature of this Consent Agreement, Respondent has corrected the violation(s) alleged in Part III above in accordance with Compliance Order Docket No. CWA-10-2021-0030.

4.11. Except as described in Subparagraph 4.7.b., above, each party shall bear its own fees and costs in bringing or defending this action.

4.12. For the purposes of this proceeding, Respondent expressly waives any affirmative defenses and the right to contest the allegations contained in the Consent Agreement and to appeal the Final Order.

4.13. The provisions of this Consent Agreement and the Final Order shall bind Respondent and its agents, servants, employees, successors, and assigns.



4.14. The above provisions are STIPULATED AND AGREED upon by Respondent and EPA Region 10.

DATED:

---

FOR RESPONDENT:

---

CODY KARST

DATED:

---

FOR COMPLAINANT:

---

EDWARD J. KOWALSKI

Director

Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division

EPA Region 10